

Parapsychological Monographs

No. 14

Methods and Models
for
Education in Parapsychology

D. SCOTT ROGO

PARAPSYCHOLOGY FOUNDATION, INC.

29 West 57th Street, New York, N. Y. 10019

2.00

Parapsychological Monographs are a continuing series of research studies published by Parapsychology Foundation, Inc.

The Parapsychology Foundation was founded in 1951 by Eileen J. Garrett as a nonprofit organization to encourage research, study and experiment in those areas of the paranormal which include extrasensory perception, psychokinesis, telepathy, clairvoyance, precognition and related phenomena.

Lee (1971)

METHODS AND MODELS FOR EDUCATION
IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY

Methods and Models
for
Education in Parapsychology

D. Scott Rožo

PARAPSYCHOLOGY FOUNDATION, INC.

Copyright © 1973, by Parapsychology Foundation, Inc.

All Rights Reserved

ISBN 0-912328-22-3

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 73-75209

PNT2



986/1985-986

(8 1005)

PREFACE

This monograph is a product of a growing need for educational material in the field of parapsychology. While more and more college courses are being offered on the subject, there are no standard texts or curricula to help structure the courses. This text is intended as an invitation for dialogue on the important issue of how parapsychology might best be presented within the framework of the educational process.

While teaching is a very personal matter, I have tried to present what I feel to be the problems of education in parapsychology and the most comprehensive way of overcoming the problems in an impartial manner, borrowing models from the basic foundations of the American educational system and adapting them to an educational plan based on both historical and contemporary mainstream work in parapsychology.

The basic purpose of this presentation is twofold. First, it is an argument for the need for education in the field within the academic establishment and, secondly, a practical guide for those wishing to structure courses in parapsychology. The scope of the monograph has been limited to those two themes since these are the most pressing issues confronting the educational crisis within psychical research. While there are other topics germane to these central issues, such as a historical survey of university involvement, I have felt it better to omit these since they have been adequately covered in other writings.

I am grateful to the Parapsychology Foundation for making possible the publication of this study.

Biographical Note

D. SCOTT ROGO has long been associated with education in parapsychology. In 1968 he coordinated an experimental course on parapsychology at the University of California, Los Angeles, and has since organized seminars and discussions at high schools and colleges in the Los Angeles area.

He has written over a dozen papers on a wide range of topics in parapsychology, including its educational aspects, which have appeared in such periodicals as the Journal of the Society for Psychical Research, the International Journal of Parapsychology, the Journal of Paraphysics, the Parapsychology Review, Theta, and others. Mr. Rogo is, in addition, the author of three books on psychical research. He writes book reviews for several periodicals devoted to psychical research. In 1972 he participated in the Parapsychology Foundation's Twenty-First International Conference on "Parapsychology and the Sciences."

CONTENTS

Preface	v
I. The Need for Discussion	1
II. Parapsychology and the Problems and Philosophy of Education	9
III. Some Approaches to Curricula in Parapsychology	27
IV. The Teaching of Parapsychology: Some Issues in Contemporary Education	51
V. The Future of Education in Parapsychology	58
Bibliography	63
Index	68

THE NEED FOR DISCUSSION

When a discipline adopts the methodology and goals of science, it, too, deserves a place within the framework of science. Whether or not ultimate truths about the nature of man or his universe will be uncovered by the researches of a discipline is certainly no criterion for whether or not its goals or methodology are legitimate. Science is a search and we cannot censure a particular line of study because that study may lead into realms of inquiry general science has ignored.

Parapsychology, after some ninety years of organized investigation into the borderlands of science, has approached a point where it must be considered within the framework of science. Whether or not it will finally find its niche within behavioral science or physical science is still an open issue. When a discipline matures and its goals and methods of research can no longer be questioned, and when that discipline offers scores of observations, experimentations, theories and counter-theories, two organized bodies must be influenced by it. First, that large structure called science must itself incorporate that discipline's data into the schemes and models of its own disciplines. Secondly, that data must be offered to new students entering the byways of science.

This monograph is directed toward the second of these issues. While parapsychology has not yet incorporated itself within the bounds of the university curricula, each year more and more courses in parapsychology are being presented. A short list of current courses reveals that more and more colleges are willing to accept parapsychology as a legitimate field of scientific, psychological or philosophi-

cal study. There are several levels of education offered to the general public. Some colleges have been teaching adult education classes in the field of parapsychology. Stanley Krippner conducted such a course at Brooklyn College and New York University. Milan Ryzl has offered extension courses at San Diego State College. Others prefer to supervise individual students for work in the field: Alan Price at Wesleyan University, Charles Tart at the University of California at Davis, Gertrude Schmeidler at the City College of the City University of New York. Still others have taken a leap into the direction of actual parapsychological curricula—courses coordinated for undergraduates, classroom teaching and discussion. In this area we find courses conducted from time to time by Charles Honorton, W. G. Roll, Robert Brier, Lawrence Casler and others.

In approaching parapsychology from an educational standpoint we are confronted by major problems not to be found in the teaching of other subjects. Of central importance is that parapsychology has no generally set curriculum. One can only be amazed at how various courses, all offered as introductions to parapsychology, vary so considerably in their structure. The main reason for this is that while parapsychology is a study of several areas of individualized topics (from ESP to apparitions to psychokinesis to survival of death) parapsychologists themselves disagree on the importance or even the validity of certain areas of investigation. This is complicated by the fact that even basic issues in parapsychology have not been resolved, making it impossible to speak of even generalized data recognized by the parapsychological community. It seems that the parapsychologists agree on only a few basic tenets, namely that the mind does have some sort of faculty or ability to gain nonsensory access to information. The hows, whys, and wherefores are still evasive. However, one thing is clear, parapsychology has adopted the techniques of general science in its quest for these elusive phenomena.

This monograph is offered mainly for the purpose of building generalized models of curricula for courses offered in parapsychology. As stated, there is no recognized general curriculum agreed upon. For example, some teachers have taught parapsychology as an experimental science emphasizing the type of research that uses laboratory techniques, statistical methods of appraisal and current research. Such courses have been the mainstay of classes offered by Carroll Nash at St. Joseph's College and those presented by Robert Brier

at C. W. Post College. Other educators have offered programs emphasizing historical or survey courses of psychical research. Gardner Murphy's classes at the New School for Social Research fit into this category.

The wide divergence of opinion on what might be taught in a generalized course in parapsychology can readily be seen by comparing two courses offered by Dr. Gardner Murphy at the New School for Social Research where vastly different curricula were offered only two years apart.

In 1945, Dr. Murphy presented a course consisting of five areas of concentration: (1) analysis of *Phantasms of the Living*;¹ (2) trance mediumship; (3) experimental telepathy; (4) philosophical approaches; (5) research methods. Basically, this course was a historical survey.

In 1947, Dr. Murphy's course was expanded to the study of fifteen areas of discussion, and was restructured into an overall view of psychical research: (1) psychical research as an area of inquiry; (2) spontaneous ESP; (3) apparitions; (4) mediumship of Mrs. Piper and Mrs. Verrall; (5) cross-correspondences; (6) study of Mrs. Willett; (7) study of Mrs. Leonard; (8) proxy sittings; (9) methods of studying ESP; (10) dynamics of ESP, Part I; (11) dynamics of ESP, Part II; (12) interpretation of telepathy; (13) precognition; (14) psychokinesis; (15) the outlook today.

In the second course entirely new areas of study are incorporated. One can also see how in the last thirty years the emphasis in research has dramatically changed. From a heavy emphasis on qualitative work, today's parapsychological scene is very much dominated by quantitative studies.

It is also unfortunately true that, although the integrity and enthusiasm of many teachers cannot be questioned, many courses are being presented by instructors who not only have a questionable background in parapsychology, but whose courses are unstructured and confused as to the very issues and topics which are the focal points of parapsychological research. Often such courses are a weird mixture of popular occultism, discredited data, misunderstood mysticism, and areas already covered by other sciences. One course description at hand offers studies of ESP, hyperesthesia, déjà-vu, dermo-optic perception, physiological correlates, illusions, hallucinations and eidetic imagery. It is certainly amazing that anyone could

offer any concrete data about physiological correlates to psi and one must wonder how the study of illusions and eidetic imagery fits into the central mainstream of parapsychology. On the other hand one notes the absence of any mention of psychokinesis, mediumship, spontaneous cases, etc. While certainly the data offered may be legitimate and factual, I doubt if any parapsychologist would find such a course useful, as a survey, to enthusiastic students. One must question if a teacher offering such a confused outline really has enough background in mainline research to be able to give factual information which is in accordance with the fundamental areas of parapsychology.

This discussion is presented to emphasize that, if parapsychology wishes to find itself incorporated into the framework of a university curriculum, some serious thought must be given to accepted models of teaching and curricula. Last year the first major attempt was made by Dr. R. A. McConnell in his *ESP Curriculum Guide*.² Dr. McConnell's book will probably be familiar to most of the readers of this monograph. It is geared toward one important area—a detailed bibliography in which the enterprising teacher may find factual and reliable material on psychical research. While not offering any concrete program for content, no doubt Dr. McConnell's short volume will guide the neophyte into the standard topics and literature on the subject. McConnell also lays an excellent foundation for parapsychology as a science and offers several suggestions for projects easily undertaken in a classroom setting.

This monograph, while it will concern itself with source references, is geared to the more immediate problems of the educational aspects of parapsychology. First it will discuss the problems confronting education in this field; secondly it will offer concrete curricula guides for various approaches to teaching; thirdly it will offer source references on each specific suggested topic.

It may be thought that this monograph is written for the enterprising teacher with little background in parapsychology. This is not the case at all. It is hoped that veteran parapsychologists themselves will benefit from it. Parapsychology seems to be a field of specialties. Most parapsychologists are self-taught in the field and have entered it through their associations with related sciences such as psychology or physics, or have been trained only in the experimental aspects of the field. Because of this, many are unfamiliar with certain areas of in-

quiry that do not interest them. While certainly their own research does not suffer from this, from an educational standpoint certain problems do arise. One prime responsibility in teaching parapsychology is to give, in a survey of the entire field, equal representation to all its aspects, and this as objectively as possible. Many parapsychologists will not hesitate to admit that they would feel somewhat reluctant to cover areas of discussion with which they are unfamiliar. This monograph will hopefully be of service to them, and in addition aid even an experienced parapsychologist in finding curricula suggestions for unfamiliar topics and sources in current literature. We are all aware that different parapsychologists have vastly different philosophies on how the subject should be approached. Some encourage experimental, quantitative research; others encourage qualitative and spontaneous studies. A similar situation exists in general psychology where we have experimental psychologists on the one hand and clinical psychologists on the other. Obviously, it is the student who suffers if, in a general introductory course of study, the experimentalist refuses to cover clinical areas of discussion or the clinician ignores experimental work. This situation and the same pitfalls exist in parapsychology when a course is offered emphasizing only one of the two major approaches to the subject.

Luckily, most subjects have built-in controls which limit the harm caused by restricted curricula. No doubt the beginning student in psychology will later be required to take courses in experimental psychology and laboratory techniques and also enter into such clinical areas as personality theory, abnormal psychology and counseling. However, in parapsychology's infant educational stage this control is nonexistent. It is unfortunate but true that today the student seeking guidance can only be given encouragement and one general survey course, which is about the limit for university programs at this time. Indeed, some students will find a parapsychologist willing to tutor or supervise them, but the general student taking a parapsychology class will probably not be interested in advanced studies.

The other control that helps with the problem of restricted curricula in the study of other subjects is that of texts. Most university studies have standard, acknowledged textbooks. For example in the field of psychology the Hilgard-Atkinson *Introduction to Psychology*³ or the *Century Psychology Series*⁴ are agreed upon standard texts offering the fundamentals of that science. The use of such texts can

make up for any deficiencies of the curriculum and teacher. These texts are often revised to incorporate flaws, criticisms, and new research. Again, parapsychology has no such guiding text, and when one surveys courses throughout the United States, few parapsychologists are found to use the same general texts. Some teach without a text, others use a multiplicity of books and reprint material, still others depend upon one text which seems to best fit into the general approach to parapsychology recognized by the instructor. I doubt if, based on current literature on psychical research, parapsychologists could come to any agreement on a general text. In many ways this is one of the most acute problems we face in attempting to sketch models for education in parapsychology. Since parapsychology has only begun to be incorporated within the bounds of university studies, no one is to blame that some sort of authoritative textbook has not been published.

All these factors emphasize that dialogue on the topic of education in parapsychology is one of the most crucial needs within the discipline itself. There is constant hope that both the behavioral sciences and physical sciences will begin to incorporate the data of parapsychology in their educational framework.* However, parapsychologists themselves have hitherto not attempted to structure their own data into educational plans.

There is still another problem in approaching and planning education in parapsychology. Parapsychology is, to a great extent, a composite science, having borrowed concepts from various other sciences including psychology and physical science. Obviously a young psychology student will want the material presented in a manner he is accustomed to; the physics student will expect physical models to be used; the philosophy student will seek to find relevance to his home discipline. When one lectures to a psychology class on parapsychology he will naturally present an entirely different format from what he offers a physics class. When offering a general course in parapsychology, the instructor may overlook the fact that his students will represent many different approaches, each expecting to be catered to. How does the instructor handle this situation?

* There is evidence of some progress. A new textbook, *Psychology and Society*⁵ edited by Marvin Karlins, does include a paper, "ESP and Credibility in Science" by R. A. McConnell, which originally appeared in the May, 1969 issue of *The American Psychologist*.

There are no ready solutions to this problem except the comprehensive background of the instructor himself. William McDougall was one of the first to stress the educational aspect of psychical research. In a paper on that subject, "Psychical Research as a University Study,"⁶ he referred to the problem of teaching psychical research to philosophy students because they have little knowledge of science and psychical research must be taught within the context of the sciences. The problem is not so much that philosophy students lack exposure to science as that parapsychology does not offer them a satisfactory exposition. The same holds true with students of psychology, medicine, physics and other sciences.

So far we have been concerned with the negative aspects of teaching parapsychology. And perhaps we might end this introduction by stressing the precious few positive facets of such a venture.

First, while parapsychology is a field incorporating the active investigation of several phenomena, the science is relatively compact. Its short history makes it correspondingly easy for one to make a rather comprehensive (even if superficial) survey of the entire field and, since the complex issues of parapsychology will probably not be discussed in introductory courses, a quick over-view of parapsychology might be sufficient for classroom presentation. Secondly, it is also relatively easy for a teacher to keep abreast of new developments. Unlike medicine, where the tremendous quantity of journals and independent workers over the world make it virtually impossible for one to keep up with even one area of the field, parapsychology has but a handful of standard journals and proportionally few serious researchers. Not only can one keep up with current research in a specific area of parapsychology, but in the entire field as well.

One will be met with a level of enthusiasm in the students who may likely not only find parapsychology an exciting area of investigation, but a provocative escape from their own areas of academic concentration, which more and more students today find too sterile and not satisfying to their needs. Although it is a moot point whether our current educational programs really are meeting the needs of today's students, there is certainly no question that the blossoming interest in parapsychology will be a source of constant encouragement and reward to the educator engaged in offering parapsychology to his students.

REFERENCES

1. GURNEY, E.; MYERS, F. W. H.; AND PODMORE, F.: *Phantasms of the Living*. London: Society for Psychical Research, Trübner & Co., 1886; 2 vols. Abridged ed. by Mrs. Henry Sidgwick (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1962).
2. MCCONNELL, R. A.: *ESP Curriculum Guide* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1971).
3. HILGARD, E. R., AND ATKINSON, R. C.: *Introduction to Psychology*, 5th ed. (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971).
4. ELLIOTT, RICHARD M. (ed.): *The Century Psychology Series*; textbooks in psychology (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts).
5. KARLINS, MARVIN (ed.): *Psychology and Society* (New York: Wiley, 1971).
6. McDougall, William: "Psychical Research as a University Study," in *The Case For and Against Psychical Belief*, edited by Carl Murchison (Worcester, Mass.: Clark University Press, 1927).

II

PARAPSYCHOLOGY AND THE PROBLEMS AND PHILOSOPHY OF EDUCATION

In the previous section I referred to a paper by the late Harvard psychologist William McDougall. This paper, entitled "Psychical Research as a University Study," was given as a lecture at Clark University in 1926. Today, almost fifty years later, it is disappointing to realize that McDougall's paper is just as relevant as it was when originally presented. McDougall outlined the various problems facing both students and universities in attempting to fit psychical research into the general scheme of education. As he stated, "The student entering this field cannot avoid contact with vast currents of traditional sentiment, which sentiments, in nearly all cases, he either shares or repudiates with an intensity of feeling that renders calm and critical judgment well nigh impossible." Even today many college administrators are openly antagonistic to parapsychology and many of our staid psychology departments also look upon parapsychology with utter disdain. It is not odd that some young undergraduates have been warned that involvement with parapsychology would jeopardize their chances for acceptance in graduate work.* I doubt if such activities would tend to disqualify a student, but this sad fact shows the rather startling "traditional sentiment" both students and teachers of parapsychology must face.

The nature of this bias on the part of universities was pertinently drawn by McDougall. One often hears the argument that the subject is obscure, its phenomena evasive and that the entire field is wrapped in ambiguity. As McDougall replied, "The difficul-

* This warning is often given at one college I am familiar with.

ty, the obscurity, the dangers of a field of research are no sufficient grounds for excluding it from our Universities. . . . Our Western civilization has definitely repudiated the old way of authority, has committed itself irrevocably to live by knowledge, such knowledge as the methods of science can attain. It cannot return to live by instinct and traditional beliefs; it has gone so far along the path of knowledge and of self-direction in the light of knowledge that it cannot stop to turn back without disaster. The inclusion of Psychical Research in the scientific studies of our Universities is the inevitable last step in this advance from a social state founded on instinct and tradition to one that relies upon knowledge and reason."

One can only ponder what role tradition plays even today in the antagonism toward parapsychology curricula. It is often argued that parapsychology has not offered any established data, nor solved problems, nor reached conclusions. Again, any science has wonderlands of speculation, yet it is not censured for it.

As McDougall saw it, the university has three functions as an educational institution: education of the young, research, and the influencing of public opinion. Today there is a great boom in research carried out in the United States at such universities as University of Virginia, City College of the City University of New York, University of Pittsburgh, St. Joseph's College, Newark College of Engineering, as well as outside the United States, e.g., at Utrecht, Holland and Freiburg, Germany. Year by year more and more campuses are opening their doors to scientific investigations into parapsychology. Perhaps the most important of these is the division of parapsychology at the University of Virginia School of Medicine.

For a general history of college activities in parapsychology, one may refer to a series of papers by Frederick Dommeyer and Rhea White on psychical research in colleges and universities, published in the *Journal of the ASPR*.¹ A current resume may be found in J. G. Pratt's "William McDougall and Present-Day Psychical Research."²

Certainly in the field of research, the universities have carried out their educational responsibilities, even if this is due almost entirely to the activities of a handful of dedicated workers. Because of this current interest in active research, the universities have inadvertently helped mold public opinion to one more favorable to the acceptance of parapsychology. However, even with this awaken-

ing interest, the responsibility for educating the students themselves is wholly lacking. Even with a division of parapsychology at the University of Virginia there seems to be no organized attempt to teach parapsychology to the general student body. St. Joseph's College used to offer a course in parapsychology annually, but although up to a few years ago it was still listed in their catalogue, it has rarely been offered since. At UCLA extension courses are offered sporadically; however, these courses are strictly structured to indoctrinate the lay and professional community and not the student body. In fact, these extension courses are presented by the School of Continuing Education and have little student attendance.

When approaching education in any field one must consider the varying backgrounds of the students. While our schools represent formal education, students are constantly barraged by informal education as well. As is well known there are five areas of education which always interplay with scholastic education. Certainly before entering into a discussion of formal teaching and training in parapsychology, the influence of five factors must be analyzed: (1) family, (2) church, (3) peer group, (4) media, (5) previous schooling.

Since parapsychology is such a misunderstood field, a teacher must be ultra-cautious in how he handles the educational backgrounds and biases of his students. To a great extent education in parapsychology may be a process of correcting misconceptions before any new and meaningful discourse can take place.

To date there is no data on the education received via home background. However, since family background is to a great extent based on the influence of church, peer groups and media, the lack of data in this area is not too much of a handicap in surveying exposure to the topic outside of school.

The church is still an important source of information. Just as the university has the educational responsibility for helping mold and guide public opinion, so the church is actively engaged in a similar endeavor.

It cannot be denied that some clergymen are both open and enthusiastic about exposing parishioners to parapsychology, and there are various organizations, such as the Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship in the United States and the Churches' Fellowship for Psychical and Spiritual Studies in Great Britain, that specifically cater to the needs of religious education in parapsychology. How-

ever, in spite of these laudable attempts to incorporate parapsychology into the framework of religious background, the amount of adverse literature is mounting. Churches and religious assemblies usually offer two types of educational material: catechisms for children and magazines for their elders. In going over several of these publications, one finds material on parapsychology rather standard. In catechism or child-educational literature, what little information is devoted to parapsychology is usually wholly negative. The prevalence of fraud is, of course, emphasized and there is the usual confusion between what is parapsychological work and what is popular spiritualism and occultism. The hackneyed demoniacal argument is used as an explanation for whatever is left. Adult education is a bit more sophisticated; usually the entire field is discredited and the material presented with so many errors of fact that one is amazed it could ever have been put into print. Other publications, being a bit more lenient, still state that while the subject may be legitimate, it deals with topics of a spiritual nature that are the domain of the church and that parapsychology is potentially dangerous.

Because of the current rise in interest in popular witchcraft and occultism, the church has taken a strong stand against too great an interest in these topics. Again, it is unfortunate that parapsychology is often included in the collage of witchcraft, black magic, pseudomysticism and astrology. In an attempt to forestall interest in these areas, several church publishers are offering books antagonistic to parapsychology. Not only are these books "offered" as semi-official doctrines but they are promoted by church groups and even the radio ministry.

This is not to say that the whole field of religious education is anti-parapsychology. There are some worthwhile attempts at general education along religious lines. For example, "Psychical Phenomena" by Reginald Omez (Volume 36 of the *Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Catholicism*) offers a fairly open discussion of parapsychology. However, even here a rather obvious bias sets in when parapsychology is "edited" to fit into church doctrines.

All in all, in surveying the indoctrination given by a background in religious education, the picture is very far from satisfactory and we may only conclude that, at best, the church is not a positive con-

tributor to the informal education of the student and, at worst, may be a detrimental one.

Probably there is no greater influence on the student than the data and information he receives from social interaction with his peers. It would be rather hard to try to pinpoint just how much general information about parapsychology is known to our college generation. However, we can make a few calculations. For example, what do college students read about the subject?

One way would be to analyze the current circulation of books on psychical research popularly read by college students. The following data were obtained by checking books read by college students at one of the California State Universities which has a rather "neutral" attitude toward parapsychology. (Unfortunately, university libraries usually do not have an equal representation of scientific vs. popular books on the subject, thus this first set of statistics may likely represent a higher level of reading by college students than is actually the case.)

Books on parapsychology seem to be checked out in three categories—those borrowed approximately once a month, those apparently read every few months or so, and those hardly read at all.

Based on the survey, the following seem to be the most popularly read books: *William James on Psychical Research*, edited by Gardner Murphy; J. B. Rhine's *Extrasensory Perception*; Louisa Rhine's *Hidden Channels of the Mind*; the Soal-Bateman *Modern Experiments in Telepathy*; Kenneth Walker's *The Extrasensory Mind*; the Ciba Foundation's *Extrasensory Perception*; and Hansel's *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*. (The popularity of the Hansel volume is probably not due to its being negative to ESP. Most likely it is often read because it is recommended by the Hilgard-Atkinson *Introduction to Psychology*⁴ text which is widely used at the college where this study was made. Further, that text does not cite the Hansel volume as being entirely negative.)

The second level are those books occasionally read: Rhine's *Reach of the Mind*; the Stone-Browning *Other Side of the Mind*; Rao's *Experimental Parapsychology*; the Rhine-Pratt *Parapsychology*; Pike's *The Other Side*; and Murphy's *Challenge of Psychical Research*.

On the last level are volumes which have been hardly ever

removed from the shelves, the books of Besterman, C. D. Broad, F. W. H. Myers, Tyrrell, Carrington, Sudre, Sinclair, Prince and others.

Some general trends can be seen in these patterns. The most popular books are those which stress the specific subject of ESP to the exclusion of other topics in parapsychology. Those few books which indicate some sort of historical interest seem to be checked out because they deal with famous persons (such as William James). Generally then, the most popular books are those written about current work and are the less academic volumes.

The heavier academic reading seems to be found in the second and third categories. Those books which are hardly read at all seem to be historical "classics" and complex volumes.

In order to test the validity of these sets of data, a similar test was made at the UCLA library and a general conformity was found. Here, too, the historical classics were dust-covered, falling into oblivion, while the more readable books on current research were invariably more often read.

As stated, these facts may be somewhat biased and indicate a higher level of taste than in fact exists. College libraries usually do not stock popular or sensational books on parapsychology. However, at the State University where the first survey was made, two rather low-level volumes were on the shelves and each had been checked out at a higher rate per year than any quality volume. Also, books on witchcraft, occultism and astrology seem to be read far more than the standard parapsychological literature.

Another indication of the type and level of literature college students expose themselves to is a study made by R. A. McConnell and T. McConnell.⁵ The authors of this study also sought to ascertain what type of reading is done by college students. To obtain their data, they checked the purchases of "occult" books by the University of Pittsburgh bookstore for general sale. They found that "occult" books break down into several categories: (1) lives of well-known sensitives; (2) popular and pseudo-mysticism; (3) life after death; (4) astrology; (5) other methods of prediction; (6) black magic; (7) popular books of ESP "tales," etc.; (8) UFOs; (9) academic parapsychology; (10) books antagonistic to the subject.

The percentages per category were: well-known psychics, 11%; mysticism, 2%; life after death, 7%; astrology, 24%; prediction,

16%; black magic, 11%; ESP and occult tales, 24%; UFOs, 2%; academic parapsychology, 3%; anti-parapsychology, minimum.

It can be clearly seen in this study that the indicated reading level is on a rather low scale, with books on parapsychology being almost at the bottom of the list. The amount of sales per topic is based on the salability of the books so we may conclude that these statistics represent the rate and type of reading by college students.

Based on this data some general conclusions may be drawn about peer education in parapsychology that will confront the teacher. First, background information will be more likely to emphasize popular psychics and occultism rather than mainline parapsychological work. Secondly, some confusion may be found between fact and fable in parapsychology and even a general perplexity about the areas of investigation embodied in parapsychology. Lastly, what information students will have on the academic literature of parapsychology will most likely be limited to current researches in the area of extrasensory perception. There appears to be a deficiency in general acquaintance with the historical or deeper aspects of psychical research.

These conclusions have both pro and con bearings on education. It again appears that the teacher will have to spend some time re-educating his students, first by clearly stating what is and what is not parapsychological subject matter. Secondly, he probably will have to throw cold water on popularly-held but erroneous opinions about parapsychology.* On the other hand, the amount of reading done by students indicates a general enthusiasm for the subject, and peer influenced hostility will be at a minimum. Peer orientation is a mixture of both favorable and unfavorable influence, but the negative aspects are nowhere near being unmanageable.

Although family and peer groups might be the main influence on the student, mass media will probably account for most of their information about parapsychology. We are faced with a media-oriented society and in looking over the goals of the media, we can see how much they may influence the newcomer to parapsychology. These goals of news-oriented media fall into the categories of re-

* The most popular of these being such opinions as: twins commonly show ESP, mothers and daughters have continuous ESP rapports, women have more ESP than men, and a host of other myths promulgated by low level popular psychic literature.

porting the news, interpreting it, entertaining the public and, like church and university, helping guide public opinion. Parapsychological developments are news and the public does expect this news to be interpreted. Certainly, the news media are more than generous when it comes to interpreting scientific developments and seem well aware of their ability to shape public opinion.

While television does offer specials on parapsychology from time to time, few of these meet any high standard of presentation. In the last ten years only one nation-wide program has offered a "special" covering mainstream research, with interviews with such figures as J. B. Rhine, Gardner Murphy, Sir George Joy of the SPR, and others. Most local programming across the country has appealed to popular interest in occultism, and general confusion over parapsychological work is evident. We cannot say that those few network series attempting to portray the work of parapsychologists are of much service! The role of TV's contribution to parapsychology can best be summed up by quoting from a recent paper on media given by Daniel Cohen:⁶ "The American television networks have done a considerable number of specials on psychical subjects. These have been, almost without exception, disasters. The programs provided some low grade entertainment, but they did not provide any real enlightenment, nor were they intended to. But, as a result, psychical research is firmly identified in the minds of the television viewing public with such showmen as Hans Holzer and Peter Hurkos. The people who produce such shows regard them as entertainment rather than television journalism. People that I have talked to in the TV field will hedge a bit about presenting something scientific, but basically they admit that what they want is something sensational, something entertaining. These same men would not treat a show about cancer, space travel or air pollution so lightly. The fact is that these men do not believe there is any particular harm in doing a bad job because they do not believe that the subject of psychical research is very significant."

Educational TV fares somewhat better than commercial TV in this respect. In fact, a local NET station in Los Angeles did videotape and present the entire recent UCLA Symposium on Parapsychology. But based on public ratings and opinion polls, educational TV is a poor second to the devotion of the American public to commercial broadcasting.

Radio and the newspaper-media offer little that is of interest in educating the public in parapsychology. Some papers such as the *Los Angeles Times* do offer articles once in a while that are fairly objective reports of a psychic case or haunting. Radio often broadcasts interviews with people in the psychic field. But no organized attempt has ever been made to keep abreast of the latest scientific research or trends within the parapsychological community.

News magazines make some attempt to issue reports on developments in parapsychology and, if one keeps up with such magazines as *Newsweek* or *Time*, one can see that articles on parapsychological research do find their way into print. However, we must again remember that the news media are rather religious in their devotion to offering interpretation along with the reports. In fact, interpretive reporting has been the main trend in journalism for many years in the United States. It is unfortunate that such magazines as *Newsweek* and *Time* seem either neutral at best, and often antagonistic to parapsychology. Usually they tend to dismiss the positive reports or minimize them by reflecting that parapsychology has still not proved its point, and the general public is led to believe that the field is a brand new study with no history or research behind it. So, while the news magazine media do offer some positive data on psychical research, the built-in bias offered along with it cancels out any favorable impression it might make on the reader. The reason for this does not seem to be due to an editorial bias by the news magazine itself, but it would appear that the news writers and news editors themselves either hold the bias or, more probably, they are just not qualified to evaluate parapsychological work because of a general lack of background in the field's methods or history. Their critical outlook on incoming reports falls into the realm of self-fulfilling prophecy.

Finally, we come to the book industry. I think one need say no more. Parapsychologists, for once, will agree about the low level of publishing in the psychic field, especially in the paperback industry. The primary motivation for either the writing or publishing of psychic books is financial. And obviously this breeds sensationalism, irresponsibility, and lack of discrimination by publishers and writers. Again one wonders whether this is wholly due to the profit motive or to the lack of editorial control because of a total unfamiliarity with the field. There are a few publishers in the United States, such as

University Books or Garrett Publications, which do specialize in high quality parapsychological books, but their sales are limited compared to major publishers and the blossoming paperback trade. On this specific market, Daniel Cohen has humorously written in the same paper previously quoted, "A salable paperback manuscript can be turned out in a few weeks, or for an experienced hack, a few days. One needn't be too careful about the facts because there are no reviewers who are going to trip you up on them, and no one is going to care very much if they are wrong."

Some interesting statistics on this topic of publishers and parapsychology may be found in the previously noted paper by R. A. McConnell.⁷ From his charts it is obvious that the majority of books offered for public consumption are put out by large profit-motivated publishers. There is certainly nothing wrong about this. However, it is well known that in psychical research the profit motive breeds sensationalism. We cannot entirely cast the blame on publishers for this state of affairs. Low quality literature on parapsychology would not be published unless there were a market for it. The real problem lies with an uneducated public that willingly purchases such books. One merely need stand at the psychic book section of any major bookstore, watch the type of literature most often bought, and listen to the rather surprising conversations that go on, to prove this point.*

I think that all of this proves that the media are potentially one of the most harmful areas of informal education to the student. They play up the sensational aspects of the field, and those media that are discriminating and that include worthwhile reports of research and developments tend to be overly critical. The only solution to this problem is public education—which is what this monograph is about. However, the teacher must be aware that any "factual" knowledge attained by his students is likely to be based on exposure to a questionable source. Again, a bit of re-education will

* During one such "experiment," I stood at the paperback "occult" section of Los Angeles largest bookstore. One young lady looked at a superficial but informative book on ESP but did not buy it since it had not been written by a Ph.D. She did ultimately purchase a very low level popular book because it had an overdone bibliography (just as bad as the book) which she felt proved the diligent researching that went into the production. Such incidents are not rare and a few hours spent at any local bookstore make a marvelous afternoon's diversion.

probably be necessary before entering into generalized curriculum plans.

The last important fount of informal education about parapsychology comes from within the academic institution itself. Students of psychology are no doubt aware of parapsychology and the usual college student body will probably have some contact with the subject during its academic training.

As with all other sources of education in parapsychology, it is important to weigh the merits of this type of exposure when evaluating the background of a college course in the subject.

It is, of course, impossible to get current reliable statistics on the manner in which parapsychology is presented to students in the college classroom. However, one can get an idea of the type of contact and influence originating in the classroom by looking over the data on parapsychology included in general psychology textbooks. Although one cannot judge the influence of the instructor's own willingness to cover this material, it can be agreed that the student will become acquainted with the subject matter covered in his textbook.

By and large *most* textbooks do not cover any topic such as extrasensory perception, nor any survey of the entire field of parapsychology. However, a good minority of volumes do pay token attention to parapsychology's contribution to the area of perception. Few books are willing to firmly accept any evidence, and most quote the standard superficial arguments against statistical work leveled at parapsychologists. While they urge that one must keep an open mind, the general attitude is pessimistic.*

A few textbooks have taken the leap to apparent acceptance of the evidence for psi. A new textbook, *Psychology and Society*, edited by Marvin Karlins,⁸ includes an essay by McConnell, "ESP and Credibility in Science," that discusses the role of psychical phenomena in the light of scientific procedures and criticism and takes its existence for granted. One of the few texts that does support the evidence for

* This section is not intended as a comprehensive survey of parapsychology presented in college texts nor as a survey of currently used textbooks, but merely as a brief summary of the ways that such texts handle parapsychological data. However, it is hoped that psychology instructors reading this monograph will be influenced, when choosing their own recommended textbooks, by the way data on psi is presented in such texts.

psi is Marian Madigan's *Psychology, Principles and Applications*.⁹ In fact, while most texts that include psi list it under the general topic of perception, Dr. Madigan places the material close to the opening of her text in a discussion of how psychology deals with human behavior. The basic material covered includes Rhine's early studies of ESP and PK and points out the 1937 declaration by the American Institute of Mathematical Statistics on the validity of the statistical models used. (See Rhine's *Reach of the Mind*.¹⁰) Her section closes with the statement that, although there is no working theory for ESP, the phenomena do exist, and quotes William James's prophecy on the coming importance of such studies. The subject is also mentioned in a discussion on problems of perception.

By and large, few texts adopt such a liberal attitude and prefer to stay neutral on the issue of the validity of psi. One widely used text is the Hilgard-Atkinson *Introduction to Psychology*¹¹ which presents both the evidence for and a critical discussion of the psi controversy. This text reports the favorable opinions of Murphy, Rhine, Pratt, Soal, Thouless and Forwald on the evidence, and repeats the procedures of early quantitative work with special emphasis on Gloria Stewart. Criticism of test results as not subject to systematic variation is considered not quite fair. The pertinent factors cited against the evidence for psi include: (1) Number of false reports; (2) questions about the validity of statistical models; (3) failure of improved methods to offer better results; (4) lack of order in the results.

The Hilgard-Atkinson text offers a lengthy critical discussion on these four areas. It cites the case of Palladino and her "exposure" by Jastrow, but without any real review of earlier reports (e.g., Carrington's *Eusapia Palladino and Her Phenomena*¹²). And anyone who really believes that the 1910 fiasco was anything of an "exposure" is one who is pushing his own "will to believe" (or "disbelieve") to the limit. Another argument is that statistics are misused and that the phenomena show no order. The only reference to available literature on the subject is to Hansel's notoriously erroneous *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*.¹³

Generally, though, few textbooks bother with as thorough and valid a presentation as appears in the Hilgard-Atkinson text. The following survey is typical of the standard material presented.

The Lindgren-Byrne-Petrinovich *Psychology: An Introduction to a Behavioral Science*¹⁴ has a small section devoted to ESP (PK

is also mentioned). The section acknowledges the work of Schmeidler and McConnell as adequately answering earlier methodological problems. The authors urge that, although few psychologists are ready to admit the existence of ESP, one must not fall into the unscientific habit of shutting one's eyes to possible discovery.

James Deese's *General Psychology*¹⁵ states only that "the status of extrasensory perception is in doubt" because it is a violation of assumptions adopted by psychologists and scientists and that all experimental work in the field is open to criticism and can be invalidated. It concludes with the statement that "all in all, a very cautious skepticism is probably the safest and least prejudiced attitude towards ESP at the present time." The Ciba Foundation Symposium on ESP¹⁶ is listed for further reference.

A fairly lengthy section on psi is included in the textbook *Psychology*, by McKeachie and Doyle.¹⁷ In this text special emphasis is given to Coover's experiments which they charge offered no evidence. The authors conveniently ignore the fact that all in all the results were statistically significant but they were not significant enough for Coover. The results would have been accepted as significant by any unbiased statistician. The section stresses the possibility of clinical error, subconscious whispering and the fact that early Zener cards were defective. The text ends by asserting that successes are reported but failures are not, so that the evidence for psi might appear stronger than it actually is. It does admit, however, that few would deem psi impossible.

A general section on parapsychology appears in the introductory chapter of B. R. Bugelski's *An Introduction to the Principles of Psychology*¹⁸ which begins by explaining the very basics of ESP and PK testing. The main part of the discussion is given over to PK results and suggests that dice are notoriously inaccurate in their balancing. This criticism is of course invalid for a large number of PK experiments and the discovery of the QD (quarter distribution), but the text continues with the supposition that, since we do not understand the nature of randomness, any evidence for psi (specifically PK) is always open to question.

A more comprehensive discussion of psi may be found in S. B. Sells's *Essentials of Psychology*¹⁹ which is content to outline the types of ESP and concludes that although any decision on the validity of psi must be deferred, continued investigation should be made.

A severe, but open-minded, presentation of ESP is found in Paul Swartz's *Psychology, the Study of Behavior*²⁰ which is significant since the text, issued by Van Nostrand Co., represents one of the University Series in Psychology. The discussion is informal and quotes a small extract of a rather poor psychic "reading." It states that respectable experimentation is being carried on but that every offering of "evidence" has been met with objection. Price's 1955 criticisms are quoted as reference. The student is requested to survey the literature for himself and make his own judgment.

A group of short discussions occur in the chapter "Misunderstood Problems of Psychology" in the text *Psychology—Its Principles and Applications* by T. L. Engle.²¹ The first discussion deals with a definition of telepathy and its possible explanation. Of course, "normal explanations" such as subconscious cueing are emphasized. One section is devoted to "coincidence" which the author feels can explain many spontaneous cases of psi. The final section asserts that many positive ESP tests are the result of sensory cueing, but it is encouraging to note that a procedure for carrying out experiments in ESP is included in the student handbook that accompanies the text.

A final example of the presentation of psi material in college textbooks appears in Floyd Ruch's *Psychology and Life*,²² a very popular text. Its small section mentions the experimental studies of Rhine and even, in passing, survival research. However, it warns that the non-repeatability of the results makes them suspect.

Although critical and in some instances a bit erroneous, it must be admitted that those textbooks which do cover psi, do so with a generally open-minded attitude and the basic arguments, though they have been answered time and again by parapsychologists, are fundamentally valid. A few significant trends can be seen in their outlines. Psychology textbooks seem aware only of current researches and unaware of either the realm of spontaneous phenomena or of any historical perspectives. The topics covered are usually limited to ESP and PK and any discussion of more complex and significant types of experimental work are deferred.*

All in all though, the way in which college textbooks present

* I have since examined a new textbook, *Psychology, the Hybrid Science* by McMahan,²³ which is generally favorable to parapsychology. This text is currently being adopted as a standard text for general psychology courses in the California State University system.

psi will probably be one of the few positive factors that help the student by acquainting him with the highlights of experimental work and the common criticisms, at the same time urging caution and open-mindedness. Of all the possible sources of background education on parapsychology, this area is probably the most constructive. Unfortunately it should be added that this objectivity may be clouded by the large number of college psychology instructors who are openly antagonistic to parapsychology.

What can one say in summing up the educational background of the college student? For one thing, it does appear that the cons outweigh the pros, and the instructor should attempt to determine the previous exposure of his student to parapsychology before entering into the actual teaching procedure. It may be necessary to correct misconceptions about psychical research and re-acquaint the student with the goals, methods and ideals of science and parapsychology. The general problems of educational background can be categorized, in conclusion, as (1) no or little previous background knowledge, (2) exposure that may have been too sensational or of questionable presentation, (3) no or little education in the home, (4) no organized source of knowledge (school, church, or textbooks). Indeed, we are just starting to face the problems of education in parapsychology.

The philosophy of education is mainly determined by its problems and nowhere are these so acute as in parapsychology. Education is more than indoctrinating students with facts and theories. The presentation of factual knowledge is only one part of an educational program. To this we might add several other goals of education: the growth of the individual, presentation of new experiences, the introduction to a scientific background and the understanding that opinion is useless unless supported by such a background.

The teaching of parapsychology is similar to the teaching of any other science: the student needs a general scientific background and a knowledge of methods of scientific inquiry as they relate to everyday life, the ability to detect spurious data masquerading as science, and an understanding of the limitations of science. (See John MacDonald's *A Philosophy of Education*.²⁴)

In the teaching of a behavioral science, the specific goals of education can be defined. There are both objectives of the teacher and objectives of the learning process. Of the first category we can list

the use of facts unbiasedly, an interest in the conclusions that can be arrived at from the application of these facts, a belief that difficult problems can be ultimately solved and that scientific progress must necessarily be slow.

All these objectives come into play when teaching parapsychology. Because of the elusiveness of parapsychological phenomena, studies after studies often show not only variances but contradictions, and an instructor must be constantly on the alert to avoid by-passing adverse data. To date, few would admit to concrete facts about the main categories of psi, other than generally accepting them. Few parapsychologists would venture to draw conclusions from the available data, and that brings us to the emphasis which must be placed on the inherent slowness of scientific progress. How can one apply the raw data of parapsychology? There are scores of theories to help in understanding psi, and the use of data pointing in the direction of some of these is a provocative area of discussion and instruction.

There are also standard goals of the learning process itself. Learning should spark a spirit in inquiry. And the wonderlands of psychical phenomena do more than enough to stimulate this interest. Learning should encourage open-mindedness and independent thinking; and psychical research, which necessitates an open mind, is such a virgin science that independent thinking is almost inherent in its study. However, learning—and perhaps our educational system is most lax on this issue—comprises not only an area of factual presentation but one of problem-solving as well. This is an area where instruction of parapsychology can be of service in the molding of any well-rounded education. Most sciences are taught against a background of established facts and explanations. Parapsychology can offer no such definitive answers and has not as yet even solved its most fundamental problems to the general agreement of its researchers. By its very nature the entire educational atmosphere of learning in parapsychology emphasizes this often ignored but important goal of education.

The impact of parapsychological education on the discipline and growth of the student was no better emphasized than in William McDougall's famous Clark University lecture:

As regards the other educational functions, intellectual training and moral discipline, it may well be claimed for Psychical Research that it ranks very high, perhaps highest of all possible subjects of Uni-

versity study. For consider—in what does such discipline consist? First, in attacking problems patiently and resolutely, in spite of failures and disappointments, in spite of uncertainty that any solution may be attainable. Surely, in this respect Psychical Research may claim a foremost place! No other field of study makes such large demands on the patience and resolution of the student. Secondly, the discipline of observing exactly and recording faithfully phenomena presented to our senses.

And later:

If, by reason of the complexity and delicacy of its problems, Psychical Research rivals all other branches of science, it far surpasses them all with respect to the demands it makes on character and, consequently, with respect to the character discipline which it affords. It requires perfectly controlled temper, and a large and understanding tolerance of human weaknesses of every kind, intellectual and moral alike; an infinite patience in face of renewed disappointments; a moral courage which faces not merely the risk and even the probability of failure, but also the risk of loss of reputation for judgment, balance and sanity itself. And, the most insidious of all dangers, the danger of emotional bias in favour of one or another solution of the problem in hand, is apt to be infinitely greater for the Psychical Researcher than for the worker in any field of science; for not only is he swayed by strong sentiments within his own breast, but also he knows that both the scientific world and the general public will react with strong emotional bias to any conclusion he may announce, just because such conclusion must have intimate bearing on the great controversy between Science and Religion. . . .²⁵

McDougall thus aptly stated that the area of education in parapsychology is a challenge not only to the teacher but to the intellectual and moral self-discipline of the student. Education is a contribution to one's growth as an individual and McDougall has brilliantly presented the pertinence of the study of parapsychology to this growth.

In the light of the problems and philosophy of education, the next step is that of curricula. To any subject there are a number of approaches, and when one is confronted with such a subject as parapsychology, with no standard educational tradition, many differing philosophies of approach will evolve. This is of immediate concern in a model for education—the actual methods of education involving the choice of well-balanced curricula. This, too, is an area fraught with difficulties.

REFERENCES

1. DOMMEYER, FREDERICK, AND WHITE, RHEA: "Psychical Research in Colleges and Universities," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 57 (1963): 3-31, 55-105, 136-162; 58 (1964): 79-104.
2. PRATT, J. G.: "William McDougall and Present-Day Psychical Research," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 64 (1970): 385-403.
3. OMEZ, REGINALD: "Psychical Phenomena," trans. from the French by Renée Haynes (Vol. 36 of the *Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Catholicism*; New York: Hawthorn Books, 1958).
4. HILGARD, E. R., AND ATKINSON, R. C.: *Introduction to Psychology*, 5th ed. (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971).
5. MCCONNELL, R. A., AND MCCONNELL, T.: "Occult Books at the University of Pittsburgh," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 344-353.
6. COHEN, DANIEL: "Parapsychology in the Mass Media," in *A Century of Psychical Research*; proceedings of an international conference, September 1970 (New York, Parapsychology Foundation, 1971).
7. MCCONNELL, R. A., AND MCCONNELL, T.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 5.
8. KARLINS, MARVIN (ed.): *Psychology and Society* (New York: Wiley, 1971).
9. MADIGAN, MARIAN: *Psychology, Principles and Applications*, 4th ed. (St. Louis, Mo.: C. V. Mosby Co., 1966).
10. RHINE, J. B.: *The Reach of the Mind* (New York: William Sloane, 1947; Apollo, 1961).
11. HILGARD, E. R., AND ATKINSON, R. C.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 4.
12. CARRINGTON, HERWARD: *Eusapia Palladino and her Phenomena* (New York, B. W. Dodge & Co., 1909).
13. HANSEL, C. E. M.: *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966).
14. LINDGREN, H. C.; BYRNE, D. E.; AND PETRINOVICH, L.: *Psychology: An Introduction to a Behavioral Science*, 2nd ed. (New York: Wiley, 1966).
15. DEESE, JAMES E.: *General Psychology* (Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1967).
16. *Giba Foundation Symposium on Extrasensory Perception*. Edited by G. E. W. Wolstenholme, and Elaine C. P. Millar (Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1956).
17. McKEACHIE, W. J., AND DOYLE, C. L.: *Psychology* (Reading, Mass. and Palo Alto, Calif.: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., 1966).
18. BUGEESKI, B. R.: *An Introduction to the Principles of Psychology* (New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1960).
19. SELLS, S. B.: *Essentials of Psychology* (New York: Ronald Press, 1962).
20. SWARTZ, PAUL: *Psychology; the Study of Behavior* (New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Co., 1963).
21. ENGLE, T. L., AND SNELLGROVE, L.: *Psychology—Its Principles and Applications*, 4th ed. (New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1964).
22. RUCH, FLOYD: *Psychology and Life*, 7th ed. (Glenview, Ill.: Scott, Foresman & Co., 1967).
23. McMAHON, FRANK: *Psychology, the Hybrid Science* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1972).
24. MACDONALD, JOHN: *A Philosophy of Education* (Scarborough, Canada: W. J. Gage, 1965).

III

SOME APPROACHES TO CURRICULA
IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY*

Parapsychology has already made some remarkable strides in engaging the universities in research and in guiding public opinion. However, the introduction of parapsychology into university activities gradually raises the problem of the classroom teaching situation. Generally, any type of teaching would have to meet the needs of a large group of students and not merely the few interested students in colloquiums or graduate seminars. A course outline would be required that will not only survey all aspects of the psychic field, but also stimulate the students into continued activities within the field.

Many attempts are being made to meet the needs of differing bodies of students. Charles Honorton offered a course at Notre Dame College of St. John's University as a four-unit honors seminar in the Division of Social Sciences. One half of the time was devoted to lectures and discussion, while in the other half, students designed, executed, and evaluated an experimental project. At C. W. Post College, Bob Brier has offered a number of courses in experimental parapsychology emphasizing only experimental work and quantitative methods of analysis.

General survey courses have cropped up over the country and have differed in the choice of curricula. At Duke University, Dr. Robert Morris conducted an honors course for psychology students, "Parapsychology: Where Has it Been and Where Is it Going?" A

* This chapter is an expanded and revised version of an article of mine that originally appeared in the *Parapsychology Review* of January-February, 1972, under the title "Three Approaches to the Teaching of Parapsychology."

generally confused course was offered in 1971 at Calvin College (Grand Rapids, Michigan) which included lectures on ESP, PK, clairvoyance, mediumship and spirit photography. David P. Rogers of the University of North Carolina gave a comprehensive course on parapsychology which included a survey of contemporary work along with such topics as ESP, PK, poltergeist phenomena, and survival. This course was run as a seminar.

The San Diego area has offered a number of brief courses, mostly under the auspices of the California Parapsychology Foundation and the colleges involved. Courses have been offered at the University of California at San Diego and at Grossmont College. In each case guest lecturers dealt with a wide variety of topics. Milan Ryzl has conducted courses in the San Diego area regularly.

Often, courses in parapsychology are designed to meet the special demands of a particular group of students. At the present writing, C. W. Post College has approved a course on the philosophical implications of parapsychology, and a few years ago the University of Waterloo (Ontario, Canada) offered a course on ESP, part of an introductory course on clinical psychology and the relationship of ESP to such psychological phenomena as hypnosis, dreaming, drug effects, and sensory deprivation. Allegheny Community College (Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania) had a laboratory ESP course instructing students in the techniques of psychophysiological testing apparatus. Graduate students were catered to at a seminar held at the University of Texas in 1969 where guest speakers included Dr. Gertrude Schmeidler.

One can see the wide variety of topics that can be discussed. Each of the various types of courses requires a discussion. However, this monograph will be concerned with just one type of course: the general survey. General survey courses fall into two categories: extension courses and classroom teaching. Each has problems of its own since there is little student-teacher relationship or instruction in extension courses. No doubt in either division, an instructor might wish to urge or require his students to carry out some actual testing projects. Since this topic is covered in Dr. McConnell's *ESP Curriculum Guide*,¹ we will by-pass it here.

There are three main approaches to teaching a survey course. One can teach parapsychology as a history course, as a survey of psychical phenomena, or as an experimental science.

In this section on curricula models I will give the basic information on various categories of topics that should be presented in the teaching of parapsychology. I also will give source references for the prospective teacher who does not have a comprehensive background in parapsychology. Unfortunately, most of the germane material is either buried in the hundred year-old archives of psychical research—in out-of-print volumes, or in technical journals. Of course, nothing will ever take the place of digging into these invaluable volumes and reading the original reports, but for the instructor wishing to bone up on parapsychology there are several books in print which will summarize the necessary information.

References are set up according to the curriculum models and each subject is given a contemporary reference or references. The suggested readings are only a brief introduction to various topics and are in no way designed to be a comprehensive survey of parapsychology.

A. THE HISTORICAL APPROACH

One obvious method of dealing with the classroom situation is the history course which requires a great deal of scholarship. Like most social sciences, parapsychology can be taught from the historical perspective. The development of the science is outlined and the various theories and phenomena studied as they came to the attention of parapsychologists. Such a course could be outlined in the same manner as a history course in psychology, art, or music, tracing the study from its pre-scientific or disorganized beginnings to its modern trends. In teaching such a course the following types of lecturing are suggested:

Topic 1. Introduction to the Subject. One could approach this topic from several angles, such as defining the various types of psychical phenomena, outlining the work and ideals of the British Society for Psychical Research and the American Society for Psychical Research; citing famous historical persons who worked in psychical research; analyzing George Price's 1955 criticisms against psi, or Hansel's volume. Students could also be introduced to quantitative methods of evaluation and given a short survey of current projects in the field.

SOURCES: An instructor should be familiar with this basic data. However, for specifics, George Price's article² attacking parapsychology appeared in *Science Magazine*.^{*} Critical reviews of Hansel's volume *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*³ can be found in the *Journals* of the ASPR⁴ and SPR.⁵

Topic 2. Factors Leading up to Organized Research. This topic covers parapsychology's early era—tales of antiquity such as the Delphic Oracle; the writings of the occult philosophers of the medieval and Renaissance periods; Swedenborg's writings; the study of early Mesmerists, such as de Puységur, who noted the existence of psi in their work with their subjects; the early writings of A. J. Davis and Hudson Tuttle. Some time should be given to the "discoveries" of Reichenbach and the history, literature and spread of Spiritualism. Witchcraft, in its relation to psychism, might also be included.

SOURCES: Various new volumes have appeared reprinting the early literature. Tales of psi in antiquity are well summed up in a *Proceedings*, published by the SPR, "Supernormal Phenomena in Classical Antiquity,"⁶ by Professor E. R. Dodds. The writings of medieval philosophers, etc., can be found in many new volumes on witchcraft. One handy reference is Ralph Shirley's *Occultists and Mystics of all Ages*,⁷ or A. E. Waite's *Alchemists Through the Ages*.⁸ A standard book on Swedenborg is Toksvig's biography,⁹ and a critical study of his alleged psi ability can be found in a paper, "Swedenborg as a Clairvoyant" by Theodore Besterman.¹⁰ The early mesmeric contributions to psychic phenomena can be found in any current biography of Mesmer, e.g., *Franz Anton Mesmer* by Jensen and Watkins,¹¹ *Hypnotism and the Supernormal* by Simeon Edmunds,¹² and, more completely and academically, in the four-volume study *Abnormal Hypnotic Phenomena*, edited by E. Dingwall.¹³ The writings of Baron von Reichenbach are reprinted in *Letters on Od and Magnetism*.¹⁴ Early spiritualist history, including A. J. Davis and Hudson Tuttle, is outlined in Nelson's *Spiritualism and Society*¹⁵ and Alan Gauld's *The Founders of Psychical Research*.¹⁶ On a popular level there is Slater Brown's *Heyday of Spiritualism*¹⁷ and Emma Hardinge's *Modern American Spiritualism*.¹⁸

* Dr. Price admits to having been "highly unfair" in a subsequent issue of *Science*, January 28, 1972.

Topic 3. The Founding of the SPR. This lecture might deal with the factors leading up to the founding of the SPR or describe the early work of that organization. In the former, one might wish to include the work of Marc Thury and Gasparin; the researches of the London Psychological Society and the report of the Dialectical Society; William Crookes's work with Home and Cook and the founding of the SPR. Description of the Society's early work could be woven into the study of *Phantasms of the Living*, early investigations of telepathy, the "Census of Hallucinations" and other early researches.

SOURCES: The founding of the SPR is excellently presented in Alan Gauld's *The Founders of Psychical Research*.¹⁹ Unfortunately the pioneering work of Thury and Gasparin is not available in current literature, but brief outlines can be found under their names in Fodor's *Encyclopaedia of Psychic Science*.²⁰ The Crookes material is reprinted with discussion in a recent book, *Crookes and the Spirit World*²¹ edited by R. G. Medhurst. This work covers D. D. Home's mediumship which is also covered in the Slater Brown volume.²² *Phantasms of the Living*²³ has been reprinted in the Sidgwick condensation. The general scope of the early SPR's work is also summed up in Rosalind Heywood's *Beyond the Reach of Sense*.²⁴

Topic 4. The Piper Mediumship. The investigation of Mrs. Piper spanned almost thirty years of the SPR's history, so some study of her mediumship is a necessity. Her phenomena fall into various stages—early studies by James and the emergence of the "Phinuit" control; the emergence of the "Pelham" control; the early studies of her in the United States; the "Imperator band"; the period of the cross-correspondences and the Faunus Message. One might also discuss the different theories accounting for her abilities—the spiritistic vs. telepathic hypotheses of her phenomena.

SOURCES: Unfortunately, there is no in-print biography of Mrs. Piper. However, chapters on her and mediumship in general may be found in either the Heywood book²⁵ or Raynor Johnson's *Psychical Research*.²⁶ The SPR has in print a booklet on the mediumship of Mrs. Piper and Mrs. Leonard by Salter.²⁷ The cross-correspondence material is best covered in Saltmarsh's *Evidence of Personal Survival from Cross-Correspondences*,²⁸ which is still available in a few book stores. A newer condensation appears in Salter's *Zoar*,²⁹

and very superficially in a popular book, *Here, Mr. Splitfoot*³⁰ by Somerlott. The famous Faunus Message appears in a complete discussion in the *Journal of the SPR*.³¹

Topic 5. The Leonard Mediumship. From a historical perspective, the SPR studies of the Leonard mediumship followed those of Mrs. Piper. A discussion of Mrs. Leonard could be divided into the various types of experiments conducted with her: the Faunus Message; the Raymond communications; book tests; newspaper tests; proxy sittings; the quantitative experiments of W. Carington; her "independent" voice, etc.

SOURCES: The Leonard material can also be found in the Heywood³² and Johnson³³ books. Other summaries appear in C. D. Broad's *Lectures on Psychical Research*,³⁴ and a condensation of the writings on her appears in Susy Smith's *The Mediumship of Mrs. Leonard*.³⁵

Topic 6. European Studies. During these early years of the history of parapsychology, much work was being done in Europe and this material should be covered—the founding of the Institut Méta-psychique; experiments by Geley, Richet, Schrenck-Notzing* with such mediums as Palladino, Tomczyk, Stanislaw P., Kluski, Guzik, and Rudi and Willi Schneider.

SOURCES: European continental work is not well represented in current literature. However, the complete scope of this work does appear in René Sudre's *Parapsychology*³⁶ and the foundations of the work are outlined in Réginald Omez's *Psychical Phenomena*.³⁷

Topic 7. Quantitative Studies. We now stand historically between the two world wars when quantitative work had begun, especially at Duke University. A discussion on this topic could cover the early experiments by Richet, Podmore, Warcollier, Sinclair and Murray and the experimental work of Usher and Burt, Coover, Troland, Brugmans, Jephson, etc. Rhine's early work must be included as well as that of S. G. Soal, Whately Carington's "picture tests," his discovery of the "displacement effect," and its effect on Soal's reevaluations. Statistical procedures should be outlined.

* At current writing, University Books is considering a reprint of Schrenck-Notzing's famous *Phenomena of Materialization*.

SOURCES: Early works on telepathy have for the most part been republished. There have been recent paperback releases of the following books covering early experimental work: Rhine's *Extrasensory Perception*³⁸ (also his *New Frontiers of the Mind*,³⁹ and *The Reach of the Mind*⁴⁰); René Warcollier's *Mind to Mind*;⁴¹ Upton Sinclair's *Mental Radio*⁴² and in hardback, the Soal *Modern Experiments in Telepathy*.⁴³ A rather full discussion of the pioneering experimental work is covered in Part I of Broad's *Lectures on Psychical Research*⁴⁴ and the Gilbert Murray experiments are covered in the Raynor Johnson volume.⁴⁵

Topic 8. General Discussion. A final area for discussion could comprise other types of phenomena not covered in this historical sketch: apparitions, poltergeists, out-of-the-body experiences, and a general survey of current research in parapsychology.

SOURCES: Data on apparitions can be found in Tyrrell's volume *Apparitions*⁴⁶ which has been reissued several times in paperback. A recent volume discussing apparitions is Bayless's *Apparitions and Survival of Death*,⁴⁷ and Hornell Hart's comprehensive "Six Theories about Apparitions,"⁴⁸ published as a volume of *Proceedings* by the SPR, is still available. Books on poltergeists are numerous, with the most comprehensive coverage in A. R. G. Owen's *Can We Explain the Poltergeist?*,⁴⁹ Raymond Bayless's *Enigma of the Poltergeist*,⁵⁰ W. G. Roll's *The Poltergeist*,⁵¹ and a paperback release of the comprehensive *Haunted People*⁵² by Carrington and Fodor.

If one does wish to adopt this historical approach there are certain inherent weaknesses, from an educational standpoint, which must be considered.

(a) Students (presumably undergraduates) entering an introductory course are not well enough informed in the field to be subjected to an outline of parapsychological history, and often have such a distorted view of the subject because of the rash of poor literature on the market and the over-glamorization by mass media, that many misconceptions about the subject must be cleared up before a meaningful learning experience can take place.

(b) What little information incoming students do have about the subject is usually restricted to current (post-Duke) developments, thus the historical approach appears sterile, out of contact, and stu-

dents are prone to lose interest since little personal relation between student and subject matter is presented. History-courses of any nature are notorious for this fault.

(c) Since the incoming student has little knowledge of actual case material within the probable limited scope of his general knowledge of the field, it is the educator's responsibility to introduce his pupils to this aspect of parapsychology. When the historical approach is employed, there is then the problem of getting so wrapped up with the historical aspects of the subject matter that actual case material is often neglected. For example, adequate discussions may be given to *Phantasms of the Living*, "Census of Hallucinations," and the Piper mediumship without touching upon any of the actual famous cases recounted therein.*

(d) Because of the history of parapsychology, several important phenomena—notably telepathy, clairvoyance and "psychometry," which have made their greatest strides in the last thirty years—must wait until fairly late in the scheme of the schedule. This must be taken into consideration along with the fact that most of the students find these phenomena of the most immediate concern, and to forestall this interest would be a bad psychological factor.

(e) Again, because of the way in which parapsychology developed, the historical approach casts the curriculum in a rather "occultist" and "spiritistic" shell. While indeed this is justifiable, many well-meaning students (not to mention campus authorities) would find this psychologically distasteful. Further, it appears to detract from the purely pragmatic and empirical scientific status parapsychology has been forced to assume in order to survive and be accepted by the academic community.

(f) Another problem with such a course outline is finding an instructor with the right background. Because of the college instructor's schedule, most parapsychology courses have become "pet" projects of psychology professors who have undertaken to teach one class in parapsychology as an augmentation to their regular teaching schedule. Usually these instructors have little deep training in the

* During a lecture on the Piper mediumship I realized halfway through the discourse that while we had discussed the various phases of the Piper mediumship, the physiology of the trance state, Hodgson's opinions, etc., we had mentioned very few actual reports in which Mrs. Piper did show paranormal cognition—though several minutes were devoted to discussing Myers's, Lodge's and Hyslop's precautions to preclude fraud.

discipline of parapsychology. Secondly, many "professional" parapsychologists have concentrated on experimental studies and are not fully versed in history, much less able to give up valuable time which could be spent in experimentation to do the research necessary for such a class. Indeed, even one with a good background in the history of the subject would find it necessary to give considerable time to the preparation of each lecture.

(g) History is a matter of personal perspective and is open to problems of bias. It is all too easy for an instructor to emphasize his own interests and theories in the framework of the previously outlined study program.

However, the historical approach does have both worthwhile and redeeming attributes. For one, it makes the student aware of the long history of scientific investigations into the paranormal, and dispels any preconceived idea that only recently has science come to grips with psychical phenomena. It also places much of paranormal phenomena in a historical perspective that can only be impressive.

All in all, though, the historical approach is too susceptible to valid objections to be successfully employed.*

B. SURVEY COURSE OF PSYCHICAL PHENOMENA

Topic 1. Introduction. The same general topics should be included as in the historical approach.

SOURCES: Same as for Topic 1 of The Historical Approach (see references 2-5).

Topic 2. Telepathy. A study of telepathy could be divided into two categories: spontaneous and experimental work, with initial studies of *Phantasms of the Living* or of modern collections of spontaneous cases, and go on to the experimental work of Murray, Warcollier, Carington. The more sophisticated work of Rhine, Soal and others should be covered, as well as modern projects such as dream research and EEG studies. Various theories, such as those of Broad, Rhine and Thouless, about the way ESP functions, can then be discussed in the light of the data presented in the lecture.

* A revised historical approach which overcame many of these difficulties was presented by Gardner Murphy at the New School for Social Research in 1947. See Dommeyer and White.⁵⁸

SOURCES: Most basic material has already been discussed, and spontaneous and experimental telepathy can be found in most survey books or introductory books on parapsychology. To these we may add the Johnson volume⁵⁴ which covers some of the theoretical problems, and a good presentation of both spontaneous and experimental psi appears in Gardner Murphy's *Challenge of Psychical Research*.⁵⁵ In 1966 Bruce Humphries released the reissue of *Extrasensory Perception after Sixty Years*.⁵⁶ Outlines of various theories for psi appear in Rao's *Experimental Parapsychology*,⁵⁷ and in Ryzl's *Parapsychology—A Scientific Approach*.⁵⁸ Dream research is well represented in Montague Ullman and Stanley Krippner's *Dream Studies and Telepathy*.⁵⁹

Topic 3. Clairvoyance. Here, too, one could divide the material into qualitative and quantitative work, first discussing work done with Ossowiecki, Forthuny, or Mme. Reyes de Z., and going on to experimental, statistical work.

SOURCES: Most of the material on famous subjects such as Ossowiecki and Forthuny are out of print. However, information on them can be found in René Sudre's *Parapsychology*⁶⁰ and in the pioneering work of Osty in Ryzl's volume⁶¹ which, it should be noted, is too faulty to be used as a general text, though it does give a good account of Osty's work. A reconsideration of Pagenstecher's work with Mme. Reyes de Z. is in the *Journal* of the ASPR in a paper by W. G. Roll.⁶²

Topic 4. Precognition. This would be the next rung on the ladder of psychical phenomena. Again, spontaneous cases can be studied as well as the statistical displacement effect found by Soal and Carington, and the theoretical discussions offered by Dunne, Saltmarsh, C. D. Broad, Tanagras and others.

SOURCES: General books on precognition are Osborn's *The Future is Now*,⁶³ Martin Ebon's *Prophecy in Our Time*,⁶⁴ and Dunne's *An Experiment with Time*.⁶⁵ Most survey books on psychic phenomena cover precognition (e.g., Johnson's *Psychical Research*⁶⁶ and *The Imprisoned Splendour*⁶⁷). The statistical aspect of the displacement effect can be found in Broad's discussion,⁶⁸ and the Osborn volume⁶⁹ covers much of the theoretical material on precognition. See also Tanagras's "Psychophysical Elements in Parapsychological Traditions."⁷⁰

Topic 5. Mediumship. This general area of discussion could be based on a combination of material on Mrs. Piper and Mrs. Leonard; cross-correspondences; the survival problem, etc. Unfortunately, very little recent research has been done in the area of mediumship, but one might augment the more academic studies with a general introduction to the whole survival problem.

SOURCES: Mediumship is covered in the literature on Leonard and Piper already cited (see references 24-35). A new book of mine—an introduction to the survival problem—will soon appear under the title *The Welcoming Silence*.⁷¹

Topic 6. PK and Telekinesis. In this section two major areas can be covered: spontaneous studies and laboratory PK. There is a great deal of data on spontaneous PK occurring around the time of death, and of course the study of poltergeist phenomena along these lines would be fitting before going into the PK work of Rhine, Forwald, Cox, and the QD effect.

SOURCES: PK and telekinesis are covered, in the best all around survey, in Louisa Rhine's *Mind over Matter*.⁷² Spontaneous PK is covered in the material on poltergeists (see references 49, 50). Forwald's material appears in Mrs. Rhine's volume⁷³ and is also presented in his own dissertation *Mind, Matter and Gravitation*.⁷⁴

Topic 7. Physical Mediumship. Here, studies could be made of old time famous mediums such as Palladino, Kluski, Eva C., the Schneider brothers, as well as of present-day gifted subjects such as Kulagina and Ted Serios.

SOURCES: Physical phenomena were studied extensively by European experimenters whose works are now out of print. Much material on them does appear in Sudre's volume.⁷⁵ Material on Eusapia Palladino can be found in a two-part article in *Psychic* by Thomas Tietze,⁷⁶ in an available reprint of *Sittings with Eusapia Palladino and Other Studies*⁷⁷ by Fielding, in Hereward Carrington's *American Séances with Eusapia Palladino*,⁷⁸ and in Holms's *Facts of Psychic Science*⁷⁹ (an excellent account of Crawford's experiments with the Goligher Circle also appears in this volume). Information on Kluski and Eva C. appear in the Sudre book,⁸⁰ and thorough discussions about Kulagina appear in several recent issues of the *Journal of Paraphysics*⁸¹ (obtainable through the Paraphysical Laboratory,

Downton, Wiltshire, England). The Serios phenomenon is covered in Eisenbud's *The World of Ted Serios*.⁸²

Topic 8. Apparitions and Hauntings. Cases covered could be presented from *Phantasms of the Living* or from Tyrrell's studies, along with the theoretical views of Myers, Gurney, Hart and others. From the data one can shift into a general discussion of hauntings, continue with out-of-the-body experiences, concentrating on content analysis of such reports presented by Crookall and Hart, and go on to experimental work such as that done by Charles Tart.

SOURCES: Apparitions have been covered (see references 46-48). General books on out-of-the-body experiences are Ralph Shirley's *Mystery of the Human Double*,⁸³ and Susy Smith's *The Enigma of Out-of-Body Travel*.⁸⁴ Specific studies can be found in Crookall's *The Study and Practice of Astral Projection*⁸⁵ and *More Astral Projections*,⁸⁶ and in the Carrington-Muldoon *Projection of the Astral Body*⁸⁷ and *The Phenomena of Astral Projection*.⁸⁸ A general survey article appears in the volume edited by Toynbee, *Man's Concern with Death*.⁸⁹ Experimental work of Charles Tart appears in the *Journal of the ASPR*,⁹⁰ and in the *International Journal of Parapsychology*.⁹¹

Topic 9. Conclusion of Studies. Two possibilities may be considered for the summing up of such a presentation: A survey of current research or theories endeavoring to show a common connection between all these phenomena, or a study of the impact of psi upon the other sciences and philosophy.

SOURCES: A good general summary of the effect of psi on general science and philosophy appears in *Science and ESP*,⁹² edited by J. R. Smythies. See also Cyril Burt's *Psychology and Psychological Research*⁹³ published by the SPR.

Most educators in parapsychology would tend to view this model of a parapsychology course much more suitable for classroom instruction than the historical approach. It presents the data adequately on a scientific level and meets the objections raised against the historical approach:

(a) The program begins with the one phenomenon with which most of the incoming students are at least acquainted. Also, since we would then begin with paranormal phenomena in their most basic

and simplest forms, there is no need to be concerned about any pre-conceived ideas the students may have, as these would be dispelled automatically as the course progresses.

(b) We would begin with concepts that the students will have some, though perhaps small, knowledge of, and they would thus have an active and dynamic attitude toward the learning experience. The students would naturally relate the incoming data to their own experiences.

(c) The data can be easily presented by using actual and hypothetical cases to illustrate the concepts involved, an important aspect to be considered.

(d) Phenomena of immediate interest and concern to the majority of the students may now be presented.

(e) The important spiritistic implications—a very essential field of inquiry—can be eased into quite naturally and related to a conceptual scheme without any occultist clouding.

(f) Instructors will be enabled to follow such a lecture outline without lengthy periods of time spent in preparation. Also, the lectures could be structured in such a way that scholarship is conserved and modern concepts and development emphasized.

(g) Since the approach is based on (1) examples, and (2) theories explaining these examples, a formula is actually being formed which prevents the bias of the instructor from creeping in inadvertently.

The historical factors need not be disqualified, and by a careful choosing of case histories to be used, a fair amount of history can readily be drawn into the discussion. As an illustration, in lecturing on spontaneous telepathy, reference can be made to the SPR's early work collecting such data.

Perhaps most important, this approach encourages involvement in such areas as class discussions, independent investigations, and even small scale research work, all of which could be an invaluable experience for the students.

This writer can see only two pitfalls in using this technique, neither of which is overly serious or unavoidable. The first is that since the instructor will be faced with undergraduate students, many of whom will be taking the course as a general education elective, there may be some difficulty in comprehending the many difficult theories which must be presented to them. Thus, it is suggested that

no theory be exhibited without a case in point which can be used to illustrate the gist of the theory. Secondly, this setup could give too much prominence to the quantitative school of parapsychological thought, and seems to play down both qualitative research and the role played by such organizations as the SPR and the ASPR in the evolution of this science.

C. PARAPSYCHOLOGY AS AN EXPERIMENTAL SCIENCE

A third approach to the subject would be an emphasis on parapsychology as an experimental science. From this standpoint experimental psi would be given prominence with historical developments and qualitative work added at the discretion of the instructor. Using this curriculum much time would have to be devoted to instructing students in statistical methods of appraisal (including not only basic statistics, but also more complex systems such as the use of X^2 and testing procedures.)

Since much literature has been published during the last forty or so years on experimental parapsychology, one can choose from many approaches in presenting laboratory work.

One approach would be to break down the study by phenomena. For example, after acquainting the students with the various categories of psi, one could begin by discussing experimental telepathy and Rhine's early work, and the controversy provoked by his studies. Further discussion would include such experimental projects as those of Soal with Shackleton and Mrs. Stewart; the discoveries of the displacement effect; the Pratt-Pearce series; more complex testing such as Tyrrell's work with Miss Johnson; and conclude with modern experiments such as dream studies, psi-missing effects and so on.

In clairvoyance the same general approach can be used, and for precognition the displacement effect can be emphasized. There are many quantitative methods for studying verbal material, and mediumistic data can be presented, for example, from the angle of the Pratt-Birge concept.

For PK study, one can present the early material published in the *Journal of Parapsychology*, Forwald's work, McConnell's and Cox's investigations, the discovery of the QD and the effects of psychological, physical and physiological variables on PK.

The first method of handling psi from the experimental stand-

point (breakdown by phenomena) presents some difficulties. Great detail must be given to methodology and, for an introductory course, it might be wise to spend more time on psi itself than on testing procedures. If the students are upper level psychology students, however, they may well have had courses in statistics and experimental psychology.

A more convenient manner of presenting experimental parapsychology would be to break down the study, not by psi effects, but by variables. It should be noted that the curriculum outline for these has concentrated on established work and has not included current researches still in progress. Since so much work is being done on so many different aspects of psi, the instructor can pick what he feels relevant to his class. Of course the same goes for any suggested curriculum outlined in this monograph. In teaching experimental parapsychology, class projects will most likely be involved, and there may be less time for the actual presentation of data on parapsychology than in a historical or similar curriculum.

In a course using variables as the organizing theme, the curriculum could be designed as follows:

ESP (PSI: SUBJECTIVE ASPECTS)

Topic 1. Psi as a Subject for Experimental Study. This would basically be an introduction to historical work, including classic cases and statistical and methodological techniques with emphasis on the Pearce-Pratt experiments, Pratt-Woodruff series, Soal's studies, and an introduction to PK.

SOURCES: The foundations of statistical work can be found in the Rhine-Pratt text *Parapsychology*,⁹⁴ and the early experimental work is summed up in Rhine's *Extrasensory Perception*,⁹⁵ and the *Extrasensory Perception after Sixty Years*,⁹⁶ and in the first part of Broad's *Lectures on Psychological Research*.⁹⁷

Topic 2. The Psi Subject. One area of testing has been with the gifted subject, and studies such as those with Stewart, Pearce, Stepanek, etc., could be outlined in addition to covering the experimental work on the effects of age and sex on psi, in hypnosis and personality factors, and on the sheep-goat effect.

SOURCES: The Stepanek material has been published in *Journals of the SPR*⁹⁸ and of the ASPR⁹⁹ in the past few years. Personality

factors have been considered in the Schmeidler-McConnell volume *ESP and Personality Patterns*;¹⁰⁰ a two-part article on the sheep-goat effect, by John Palmer, appears in the *Journal of the ASPR*.¹⁰¹ Other personality variables appear in two monographs issued by the Parapsychology Foundation, *A Review of Published Research on the Relationship of Some Personality Variables to ESP Scoring Level*¹⁰² by Gordon Mangan, *ESP in Relation to Rorschach Test Evaluation*, by Gertrude Schmeidler.¹⁰³ Summary of the evidence that hypnosis affects psi can be found in a paper by Charles Honorton and Stanley Krippner in an issue of the *Journal of the ASPR*.¹⁰⁴ Still other personality variables are discussed in Rao's *Experimental Parapsychology*.¹⁰⁵

Topic 3. Objective Aspects of Psi. This would include a study of the target material such as in card guessing, Carington's drawing tests, the effects of distance on ESP (i.e., the work of Osis), the displacement effect, and various studies on the interpersonal relationship of subject and experimenter.

SOURCES: The Rao volume¹⁰⁶ gives a good summary of the distance factor in ESP. See also the *Proceedings of the ASPR*¹⁰⁷ for more current research on this topic.

Topic 4. Psychology of Psi. This wide range of experiments can be presented from the angle of conscious vs. unconscious psi, the data about the decline effect and psi-missing, the U curve and so forth.

SOURCES: See Rao¹⁰⁸ for pertinent information.

PK: (PSI: OBJECTIVE ASPECTS)

Topic 5. General PK. This entire body of material can be presented from the standpoint of PK effects and their relation to psi in general or as a separate study. Early PK methods of research and early results should be covered.

SOURCES: Early PK experiments are summed up in Louisa Rhine's *Mind Over Matter*¹⁰⁹ and to a lesser extent in her *ESP in Life and Lab*.¹¹⁰

Topic 6. Psychological Study of PK. This area would include the study of such influences as attitude and personality on PK results.

SOURCES: See Louisa Rhine's *Mind-over Matter*¹¹¹ for a comprehensive summary of PK research.

Topic 7. Physical Study of PK. A study of physical effects such as distance, number of dice, or material employed, should be covered. The entire range of PK placement tests with an emphasis on the work of Forwald, Cox, etc., should be discussed.

SOURCES: For the physical aspects of PK refer to various papers in the *Journal of Parapsychology* by Haakon Forwald^{112,113} and to his recent monograph, *Mind, Matter and Gravitation*.¹¹⁴

Topic 8. Conclusions. The entire gamut of psi can now be examined from the theoretical view with various concepts presented for the class to consider and discuss.

SOURCES: Models for explaining psi are summed up in Rao's book *Experimental Parapsychology*¹¹⁵ which covers both ESP and PK.

Since instructors might wish to have students run experiments or plan projects, the following material may be of aid in such activities: Appendices in the McConnell *ESP Curriculum Guide*;¹¹⁶ *Tests for Extrasensory Perception*¹¹⁷ by D. J. West; *Manual for Introductory Experiments in Parapsychology*¹¹⁸ by Louisa Rhine. The Rhine-Pratt *Parapsychology*¹¹⁹ has more comprehensive charts for evaluating tests than the preceding journals or books; also Robert Thouless's *From Anecdote to Experiment in Psychological Research*¹²⁰ which offers valuable material on the methodology and findings of experimental research.

As with any approach, this model, too, has strengths and weaknesses. The first difficulty is that the students may not be familiar with the intricacies of statistical appraisal. If parapsychology is taught from an experimental angle, students may remain ignorant of the early investigations and the history of organized research. Certain types of phenomena, such as spontaneous cases, may be by-passed. However, there are certain merits to the experimental approach. For one, it is a much more dynamic way of presenting psi, since students will become actively involved in testing projects. Students are trained in parapsychology as well as introduced to the subject and literature of psi, and are immediately shown the relation of para-

psychology to the general methods and philosophy of science—both behavioral and physical.

This method of instruction also answers the arguments against the historical approach:

(a) Students are shown the difference between the way psi is researched and the picture they may have imagined from the various media.

(b) The method is dynamic and the students, presumably with projects designed and executed, will be involved actively in the study of psi.

(c) All material presented will be of immediate concern to the student since the studies of variables will be the crux of their own experimentation, and case studies will not be by-passed since all the material presented is based on actual experimental results.

(d) More recent work, the type of experiments and subjects the students are most interested in or familiar with are immediately concentrated upon.

(e) The material is presented within the framework of orthodox science.

(f) The amount of current literature in experimental psi makes it easier for the instructor, without too firm a background in psi, to gather material for class presentation.

(g) Bias will be at a minimum if the different evidence, theories and variables of psi are presented.

One might also assemble a curriculum employing a mixture of both experimental parapsychology and qualitative methods by using a breakdown as follows:

1. Parapsychology and science and the founding of the SPR
2. Telepathy, spontaneous cases
3. Clairvoyance and precognition
4. Methods of quantitative tests of ESP
5. Results and implications of such work
6. Mediumship
7. Spontaneous PK and poltergeist phenomena
8. Laboratory PK
9. Physical mediumship
10. Theoretical aspects of psi and the bearing of psi on science, psychology and philosophy.

The foundations for a course in parapsychology will depend largely on such factors as the type of students, the background of the instructor, the texts chosen, and the facilities of the university. The models of curricula which have been outlined are only a few of many different approaches to the study of parapsychology with whatever negative and positive aspects may be involved, and indicate only the very minimum of what might be taught in each approach.

REFERENCES

1. McCONNELL, R. A.: *ESP Curriculum Guide* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1971).
2. PRICE, GEORGE: "Science and the Supernatural," *Science*, August 26, 1955.
3. HANSEL, C. E. M.: *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966).
4. STEVENSON, IAN: "An Antagonist's View of Parapsychology. A review of Professor Hansel's book, *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 61 (1967): 254-267.
5. MEDHURST, R. G.: "The Fraudulent Experimenter: Professor Hansel's Case Against Psychical Research," *J. Soc. Psych. Res.* 44 (1968): 217-231.
6. DODDS, E. R.: "Supernormal Phenomena in Classical Antiquity," *Proc. Soc. Psych. Res.* 55 (1971): 189-237.
7. SHIRLEY, RALPH: *Occultists and Mystics of All Ages* (London: Rider, 1920; New Hyde Park: University Books, 1972).
8. WAITE, A. E.: *Alchemists Through the Ages* (orig. ed., London, 1888; New York: Rudolf Steiner Publications, 1970).
9. TOKSVIG, SIGNE: *Emanuel Swedenborg, Scientist and Mystic* (London: Faber and Faber, 1948).
10. BESTERMAN, THEODORE: "Swedenborg as a Clairvoyant," in *Collected Papers on the Paranormal* (New York: Garrett Publications, 1968).
11. JENSEN, ANN, AND WATKINS, MARY LOU: *Franz Anton Mesmer—Physician Extraordinaire* (New York: Garrett Publications, 1967).
12. EDMUNDS, SIMEON: *Hypnotism and the Supernormal* (London: Aquarian Press; Hackensack, N.J.: Wehman Bros., 1961).
13. DINGWALL, ERIC J.: *Abnormal Hypnotic Phenomena—A Survey of Nineteenth Century Cases*, 4 vols. (London: J. & A. Churchill; New York: Barnes & Noble; 1967, 1968).
14. REICHENBACH, KARL VON: *The Odic Force; Letters on Od and Magnetism*. Trans. and introd. by F. D. O'Byrne (London: Hutchinson & Co., 1926; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1968).
15. NELSON, GEOFFREY K.: *Spiritualism and Society* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1969).
16. GAULD, ALAN: *The Founders of Psychical Research* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1968).
17. BROWN, SLATER: *The Heyday of Spiritualism* (New York: Hawthorn Books, 1970; Pocket Books, 1972).

18. HARDINGE [BRITTEN], EMMA: *Modern American Spiritualism* (New York, 1870; reprint, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1970).
19. GAULD, ALAN: *Op. cit.*, ref. 16.
20. FODOR, NANDOR: *Encyclopaedia of Psychic Science* (London: Arthurs Press, 1933; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1966).
21. MEDBURST, R. G., ed.: *Crookes and the Spirit World* (London: Souvenir Press; New York: Taplinger; 1972).
22. BROWN, SALTER: *Op. cit.*, ref. 17.
23. GURNEY, EDMUND; MYERS, FREDERIC W. H.; AND PODMORE, FRANK: *Phantasms of the Living* (London: Society for Psychical Research, Trübner & Co., 1886; 2 vols. Abridged ed. by Mrs. Henry Sidgwick, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1962).
24. HEYWOOD, ROSALIND: *Beyond the Reach of Sense; an Inquiry into Extra-sensory Perception* (New York: Dutton, 1961. British ed., *The Sixth Sense*, London: Chatto & Windus, 1959).
25. *Ibid.*
26. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *Psychical Research* (London: English Universities Press, 1955; New York: Funk and Wagnalls, pap., 1968).
27. SALTER, W. H.: *Trance Mediumship: An Introductory Study of Mrs. Piper and Mrs. Leonard* (London: Society for Psychical Research, 1950; rev. ed. by Margaret Eastman, 1962).
28. SALTMARSH, H. F.: *Evidence of Personal Survival from Cross-Correspondences* (London: Bell & Sons, 1938).
29. SALTER, W. H.: *Zoar; or the Evidence of Psychical Research Concerning Survival* (London: Sidgwick & Jackson, 1961).
30. SOMERLOTT, ROBERT: "Here, Mr. Splitfoot" (New York: Viking Press, 1971).
31. ROGO, D. SCOTT: "The Faunus Message': A Review and New Interpretation," *J. Soc. Psych. Res.* 46 (1971): 223-227.
32. HEYWOOD, ROSALIND: *Op. cit.*, ref. 24.
33. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *Op. cit.*, ref. 26.
34. BROAD, C. D.: *Lectures on Psychical Research* (New York: Humanities Press, 1962).
35. SMITH, SUSY: *The Mediumship of Mrs. Leonard* (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1964).
36. SUDRE, RENE: *Parapsychology*, trans. by C. E. Green (New York: Citadel Press, 1960; orig. ed., Paris: Payot, 1956).
37. OMEZ, REGINALD: "Psychical Phenomena," trans. from the French by Renée Haynes (Vol. 36 of the Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Catholicism; New York: Hawthorn Books, 1958).
38. RHINE, J. B.: *Extra-Sensory Perception* (Boston: Boston Society for Psychic Research, 1934; Bruce Humphries, 1964).
39. RHINE, J. B.: *New Frontiers of the Mind* (London: Faber and Faber; New York: Farrar and Rhinehart; 1937).
40. RHINE, J. B.: *The Reach of the Mind* (New York: William Sloane, 1947; Apollo, 1961; William Morrow, 1971).
41. WARCOLLIER, RENE: *Mind to Mind* (New York: Creative Age Press, 1948; Collier-Macmillan, 1963).
42. SINCLAIR, UPTON: *Mental Radio* (Pasadena, Calif.: author, 1930; rev. 2nd printing, Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1962; pap., New York: Macmillan, 1971).
43. SOAL, S. G., AND BATEMAN, F.: *Modern Experiments in Telepathy* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1954).
44. BROAD, C. D.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 34.
45. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *Op. cit.*, ref. 26.

46. TYRRELL, G. N. M.: *Apparitions* (London: Gerald Duckworth, 1953; New York: Collier-Macmillan, 1962, 1970).
47. BAYLESS, RAYMOND: *Apparitions and Survival of Death* (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1973).
48. HART, HORNEILL et al.: "Six Theories about Apparitions," *Proc. Soc. Psych. Res.* 50 (1956): 153-239.
49. OWEN, A. R. G.: *Can We Explain the Poltergeist?* (New York: Garrett Publications, 1964).
50. BAYLESS, RAYMOND: *Enigma of the Poltergeist* (West Nyack, N.Y.: Parker Publishing Co., 1967; pap., New York: Ace Books, 1968).
51. ROLL, W. G.: *The Poltergeist* (New York: New American Library, 1972).
52. CARRINGTON, HERWARD, AND FODOR, NANDOR: *Haunted People* (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1951; New American Library, Signet, 1968).
53. DOMMEYER, FREDERICK, AND WHITE, RHEA: "Psychical Research in Colleges and Universities," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 57 (1963): 3-31, 55-105, 136-162; 58 (1964): 79-104.
54. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *Op. cit.*, ref. 26.
55. MURPHY, GARDNER: *Challenge of Psychical Research* (New York: Harper & Row, 1961).
56. RHINE, J. B., and others: *Extra-Sensory Perception after Sixty Years* (New York: Henry Holt, 1940; Boston: Bruce Humphries, 1966).
57. RAO, K. RAMAKRISHNA: *Experimental Parapsychology* (Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1966).
58. RYZL, MILAN: *Parapsychology—A Scientific Approach* (New York: Hawthorn Books, 1970).
59. ULLMAN, MONTAGUE, AND KRIPPNER, STANLEY: *Dream Studies and Telepathy*, Parapsychological Monograph No. 12 (New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1970).
60. SUDRE, RENE: *Op. cit.*, ref. 36.
61. RYZL, MILAN: *Op. cit.*, ref. 58.
62. ROLL, W. G.: "Pagenstecher's Contribution to Parapsychology," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 61 (1967): 219-240.
63. OSBORN, ARTHUR W.: *The Future Is Now* (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1961; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1967).
64. EBON, MARTIN: *Prophecy in Our Time* (New York: New American Library, 1968).
65. DUNNE, J. W.: *An Experiment with Time* (London: Faber and Faber, 1927).
66. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *Op. cit.*, ref. 26.
67. JOHNSON, RAYNOR: *The Imprisoned Splendour* (New York: Harper & Row, 1953; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1971).
68. BROAD, C. D.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 34.
69. OSBORN, ARTHUR W.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 63.
70. TANAGRAS, A.: *Psychophysical Elements in Parapsychological Traditions*, Parapsychological Monograph No. 7 (New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1967).
71. ROGO, D. SCOTT: *The Welcoming Silence* (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1973).
72. RHINE, LOUISA: *Mind over Matter* (New York: Macmillan, 1970).
73. *Ibid.*
74. FORWALD, HAAKON: *Mind, Matter, and Gravitation*, Parapsychological Monograph No. 11 (New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1969).
75. SUDRE, RENE: *Op. cit.*, ref. 36.

76. TIETZE, THOMAS R.: "Eusapia Palladino—A Study in Paradox," *Psychic*, January-February, March-April, 1972.
77. FIELDING, EVERARD: *Sittings with Eusapia Palladino and Other Studies* (New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1963).
78. CARRINGTON, HERWARD: *American Séances with Eusapia Palladino* (New York: Garrett Publications, 1954).
79. HOLMS, A. CAMPBELL: *Facts of Psychic Science* (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 1925; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1969).
80. SUDRE, RENE: *Op. cit.*, ref. 36.
81. *Journal of Paraphysics*, Vol. 2, Nos. 3, 5; Vol. 3, Nos. 3, 4; Vol. 4, Nos. 1, 2, 3; Vol. 5, No. 5 (Downton, Wiltshire, England: Paraphysical Laboratory).
82. EISENBUD, JULE: *The World of Ted Serios* (New York: William Morrow, 1967; Paperback Library, 1969).
83. SHIRLEY, RALPH: *The Mystery of the Human Double* (London: Rider & Co., n.d.; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1965).
84. SMITH, SUSY: *The Enigma of Out-of-Body Travel* (New York: Garrett Publications, 1965; pap., New American Library, n.d.).
85. CROOKALL, ROBERT: *The Study and Practice of Astral Projection* (London: Aquarian Press, 1961; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1966).
86. CROOKALL, ROBERT: *More Astral Projections* (London: Aquarian Press, 1964).
87. MULDOON, SYLVAN, AND CARRINGTON, HERWARD: *The Projection of the Astral Body* (London: Rider & Co., 1929, 1956; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, n.d.).
88. MULDOON, SYLVAN, AND CARRINGTON, HERWARD: *The Phenomena of Astral Projection* (London: Rider & Co., 1951; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969).
89. HEYWOOD, ROSALIND: "Attitudes to Death in the Light of Dreams and Other Out-of-the-Body Experiences," in *Man's Concern with Death*, edited by Arnold Toynbee and others (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1968; New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969).
90. TART, CHARLES T.: "A Psychophysiological Study of Out-of-the-Body Experiences in a Selected Subject," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 62 (1968): 3-27.
91. TART, CHARLES T.: "A Second Psychophysiological Study of Out-of-the-Body Experiences in a Gifted Subject," *Int. J. Parapsychol.* 9 (1967): 251-258.
92. SMYTHIES, J. R. (ed.): *Science and ESP* (New York: Humanities Press, 1967).
93. BURT, CYRIL: *Psychology and Psychical Research*; 17th Frederic W. H. Myers Memorial Lecture, 1968 (London: Society for Psychical Research, 1968).
94. RHINE, J. B., AND PRATT, J. G.: *Parapsychology—Frontier Science of the Mind* (Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1957; rev. ed., 1962).
95. RHINE, J. B.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 38.
96. RHINE, J. B. and others: *Op. cit.*, ref. 56.
97. BROAD, C. D.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 34.
98. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research* 42 (1964): 381-389.
99. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* 61 (1967): 95-119; 62 (1968): 28-45, 158-170, 171-189, 226-244; 63 (1969): 21-37, 253-272; 64 (1970): 18-39; 65 (1971): 75-82.

100. SCHMEIDLER, GERTRUDE R., AND MCCONNELL, R. A.: *ESP and Personality Patterns* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1958).
- X 101. PALMER, JOHN: "Scoring in ESP Tests as a Function of Belief in ESP," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 73-408; 66 (1972): 1-27.
102. MANGAN, GORDON: *A Review of Published Research on the Relationship of Some Personality Variables to ESP Scoring Level*, Parapsychological Monograph No. 1 (New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1958).
103. SCHMEIDLER, GERTRUDE: *ESP in Relation to Rorschach Test Evaluation*, Parapsychological Monograph No. 2 (New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1960).
104. HONORTON, CHARLES, AND KRIPPNER, STANLEY: "Hypnosis and ESP Performance—A Review of the Experimental Literature," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 63 (1969): 214-252.
105. RAO, K. RAMAKRISHNA: *Op. cit.*, ref. 57.
106. *Ibid.*
107. OSIS, KARLIS, AND TURNER, MALCOLM E.: "Distance and ESP—A Transcontinental Experiment," *Proc. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 27 (1968): 1-48.
108. RAO, K. RAMAKRISHNA: *Op. cit.*, ref. 57.
109. RHINE, LOUISA E.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 72.
110. RHINE, LOUISA E.: *ESP in Life and Lab* (New York: Macmillan, 1967).
111. RHINE, LOUISA E.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 72.
112. FORWALD, HAAKON: "A Further Study of the PK Placement Effect," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 59-67; "A Continuation of the Experiments in Placement PK," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 273-283; "Chronological Decline Effects in a PK Placement Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 32-36; "An Approach to Instrumental Investigation of Psychokinesis," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 219-233; "Experiments with Alternating PK Placement and Control Tests," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 45-51; "A Study of Psychokinesis in Its Relation to Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 133-154; "A Continuation of the Study of Psychokinesis and Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 21 (1957): 98-121; "An Experimental Study Suggesting a Relationship between Psychokinesis and Nuclear Conditions of Matter," *J. Parapsychol.* 23 (1959): 97-125; "A PK Experiment with Die Faces as Targets," *J. Parapsychol.* 25 (1961): 1-12; "An Experiment in Guessing ESP Cards by Throwing a Die," *J. Parapsychol.* 27 (1963): 16-22.
113. MCCONNELL, R. A., AND FORWALD, HAAKON: "Psychokinetic Placement: I. A Re-Examination of the Forwald-Durham Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 51-69; "Psychokinetic Placement: II. A Factorial Study of Successful and Unsuccessful Series," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 198-213; "Psychokinetic Placement: III. Cube-Releasing Devices," *J. Parapsychol.* 32 (1968): 9-38.
114. FORWALD, HAAKON: *Op. cit.*, ref. 74.
115. RAO, K. RAMAKRISHNA: *Op. cit.*, ref. 57.
116. MCCONNELL, R. A.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 1.
117. WEST, D. J.: *Tests for Extrasensory Perception*, rev. ed. (London: Society for Psychical Research, 1954).
118. RHINE, LOUISA E.: *Manual for Introductory Experiments in Parapsychology* (Durham, N.C.: Parapsychology Press, 1966).
119. RHINE, J. B., AND PRATT, J. G.: *Op. cit.*, ref. 94.
120. THOULESS, R. H.: *From Anecdote to Experiment in Psychical Research* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972).

ADDENDUM

This monograph has been issued for the furtherance of a broad educational program in parapsychology. However, there are sources of education other than classroom learning.

There are several organizations that offer supervision for work in parapsychology. Non-credit experience-oriented possibilities for student work in this field are offered at the following centers; the information in parentheses gives the type of work and the person to contact:

Division of Parapsychology, University of Virginia School of Medicine, Charlottesville, Virginia 22901 (summer fellowships; Dr. Ian Stevenson).

Foundation for Research on the Nature of Man (FRNM), College Station, Durham, North Carolina (research fellowships, summer fellowships; Director of the Institute for Parapsychology).

Maimonides Medical Center, 4082 Tenth Ave., Brooklyn, New York 11219 (summer fellowships in the Menninger Dream Laboratory; Dr. Stanley Krippner).

Psychical Research Foundation, Duke Station, Durham, North Carolina 27706 (summer fellowships; W. G. Roll).

Graduate programs for either the M.A. or Ph.D. with a thesis in parapsychology are offered at the following colleges and universities. The degree obtainable and the name of the supervisor are given in parentheses:

City College of the City University of New York, New York, N.Y. 10031 (M.A., Ph.D.; Gertrude Schmeidler).

University of California at Davis, Davis, California 95616 (Ph.D.; Charles Tart).

West Georgia College, Carrollton, Georgia 30117 (M.A.; Horace Stewart and Henry Moore).

Duke University, Durham, North Carolina (M.A., Ph.D.; various faculty members).

Foreign colleges offering such opportunities include:

University of Edinburgh, 60 Pleasance, Edinburgh EH8, 9TJ, Scotland.

Institut für Grenzgebiete der Psychologie und Psychohygiene, Eichhalde 12, 78 Freiburg i. Br., Germany.

Andhra University, Waltair, A.P., India.

IV

THE TEACHING OF PARAPSYCHOLOGY: SOME ISSUES IN CONTEMPORARY EDUCATION

Deciding on a curriculum is only one half the problem of teaching parapsychology. There are issues in contemporary education which are of utmost importance to the parapsychologist. Two of these issues, here discussed, concern the value of educational techniques for the student.

In approaching the organization of a curriculum, the teacher must decide upon the manner of presentation. One can conduct a course based on subject-centered planning or on a newer trend in modern education, student-centered planning.

The preceding outlines are geared toward the subject-centered approach but can be modified for a student-centered approach. The subject-centered approach is the most traditional form of education. The major distinction of this approach is its fundamental function, i.e., to impart compartmentalized units of knowledge with the intent of familiarizing the students with set arrangements of data and theories. When approaching this philosophy of curriculum choice, the emphasis is on oral discourse and explanation; education is a step-by-step process, and students rarely venture unguided into new areas of inquiry.

The model designed as a general survey of psychical phenomena is a typical subject-oriented technique, and for the instructor wishing to base a teaching plan on a subject-oriented plan this outline is probably the easiest to adopt. However, this approach has been criticized by many in the field of education. It is claimed that the creativity or individuality of the student is stunted and that learning is by rote with little retention or understanding. Advocates of the subject-

centered approach contend that a study must be conducted step-by-step and that knowledge must be ordered to be meaningful.

Student-centered curriculum focuses more on the development of intellect and on student activity rather than on specific organized data. The emphasis is on the use of factual data in problem-solving and on the usefulness of the data to the student in the particular area of his project or independent study. The whole philosophy of this approach is that any learning must be applicable to day-to-day living and meaningful to personal experience. The teacher is merely a guide to the student, not an instructor. The student-centered curriculum is the basis for the "open classroom" technique of education, one of the most controversial concepts in the field of education.

For the instructor interested in the student-centered approach to teaching parapsychology, the experimental approach is most easily adaptable since presentations are geared to unifying the data of parapsychology and helping students in their own experimental projects.

It is up to the instructor to choose one or another of these approaches (or integrate them such as Charles Honorton did at Notre Dame), but the success of either lies with the coordinator. The following problems should be kept in mind when teaching parapsychology in the classroom:

1. Should the teaching be centered on subject or student? In the field of parapsychology we have a dual problem. Since parapsychology has almost become purely an experimental science, the organization of a curriculum should be based on the needs of the individual. However, since the field is so full of misconceptions, there is the problem of whether any knowledge gained about the meaning of parapsychology can be evaluated without a firm factual background in the subject matter. One cannot use knowledge without evaluating it, and it is still an open issue whether an approach specially structured to the learner instead of the subject will be of service in an introductory course. The issue is not really *which* approach to employ, but at what point parapsychology can cease to be compartmentalized knowledge and can be applied to problem-solving. One cannot solve problems unless they are presented as natural implications of raw data. On the other hand, issuing reams of facts, names and theories is not of much help in sharpening the student's critical faculties.

2. Should the subject matter be decided upon before the actual teaching or be based on mutual selection as topics arise during the

educational process? To a great extent this will depend on the maturity of the class. As has been stated, parapsychology, except in its popular representation, is foreign to most students and the prime issue here is whether students with either a limited or distorted background have the necessary insight to choose their own plans of teaching. For example, an adult education parapsychology course at Brooklyn College began as a formal presentation of the field, but because of the special interest of the students, the emphasis was shifted onto ways of developing psi faculties. While certainly such a program was more in keeping with the interests and goals of the students, the course's value as a way of furthering their educational background and intellectual growth is questionable. Because of the nature of parapsychology, an overall structure and thought-out curriculum planning seems advisable, but only as long as the student can use the data. This is why the problems confronting psychology, physics, philosophy, etc., into which the student can orient himself because of previous background, should be made a part of the presentation. Even in the student-oriented experimental approach, organized data on the findings of experimental work are necessary before students can begin their own projects.

3. Should class control be maintained by the teacher or by mutual cooperation of students with the teacher as adviser? The answer to this approach is governed by the type of course adopted. In an experimental situation the latter would be appropriate since the learning is controlled by the students. However, for survey coverage of parapsychology, the teacher, being the only one with sufficient knowledge about the subject, must necessarily set himself up as an authority figure.

The various issues, only lightly touched upon here, distill down to the primal argument: Should education be a schooling or a process of growth? Obviously, only by wisely integrating various approaches to parapsychology will the problem of schooling and that of intellectual growth both be successfully met. As McDougall pointed out, psychical research is necessary not only as a fundamental part of learning and schooling itself, but also to meet the moral, social, and intellectual needs of the maturing student.

No general curriculum can solve the various problems of the educational approach. With the instructor integrating the three major approaches to curricula planning and placing emphasis on any

of the subtypes, hopefully the student will find a rewarding personal experience as well as acquire a better overall educational background in psychology and science.

No matter which approach is ultimately used in the classroom, the key to an effective educational experience is to present the data that meet the objectives of cognitive learning.

Learning is a gradual process, and the student must go through its many stages before attaining insight into the subject matter. Can parapsychology be presented in such a manner? Since the data of parapsychology are sporadic, with unanswerable questions confronting us at every turn, organizing any curriculum in parapsychology is a task more difficult than in any other science.

To show how parapsychology can fit into a neat and ordered scheme of educational planning, a taxonomy of the principles behind a general education in parapsychology can be structured and placed within hierarchical arrangements of basic education.

There have been a number of attempts to make taxonomies of educational aims. Here is Bloom's classification as it appears in his *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives*:¹

1. Knowledge
 - Knowledge of specifics
 - Knowledge of ways and means of dealing with specifics
 - Knowledge of the universals and abstractions in a field
2. Comprehension
 - Translation
 - Interpretation
 - Extrapolation
3. Application
4. Analysis
 - Analysis of elements
 - Analysis of relationships
 - Analysis of organizing principles
5. Synthesis
 - Production of a unique communication
 - Production of a plan or proposed set of operations
 - Deviations of a set of abstract relations

6. Evaluation

- Judgments in terms of internal evidence
- Judgments in terms of external criteria

From the generalized scheme, a learning approach to parapsychology can be constructed. The following chart illustrates how any technique of education in parapsychology can be modeled to fit the objectives of contemporary education.

<i>Model</i>	<i>Area of Parapsychology</i>
1. Knowledge:	
Specifics	Data about psychical phenomena
Ways and Means of dealing with specifics	Methodology of parapsychology
Universals and abstractions in a field	General principles of psi
2. Comprehension:	
Translation	Understanding of the specifics of psi
Interpretation	Meaning of psi
Extrapolation	Implications of psi
3. Application:	Experimental projects
4. Analysis:	
Of elements	Governing principles of psi effects
Of relationships	Experimental psi compared to spontaneous psi
Of organizing principles	Psychological and physical aspects of psi
5. Synthesis:	
Communication	Statistical techniques
Set of operations	Proposals for future experimentation
Abstract relations	Theoretical frameworks
6. Evaluation:	
Internal evidence	Content analysis
External criteria	Statistical analysis

Cognitive Learning	Topic	Specific Data	Affective Learning
1. Knowledge Specifics Means of dealing with specifics Universals	Data Methodology Principles	A general survey of psi-ESP, PK, and general issues, basic philosophy of methods (controls, statistics) and the feasibility of psi within frameworks of science.	Receiving: Awareness Willingness Control of attention
2. Comprehension: Translation Interpretation Extrapolation	Understanding Meaning Implication	Class discussion on psi, the implications of psi for science and psychology, and the relation of the data to everyday life.	Responding: Acquiescence
3. Application:	Experimental Projects	Testing or ESP projects.	Responding: Willingness Satisfaction
4. Analysis: Of elements Of relationships Of organizing principles	General principles Spontaneous and Experimental psi Aspects of psi	General effects of variables on psi, etc. Relation of spontaneous phenomena to experimental psi. Psychological and physical studies of psi (sheep-goat effect), etc.	Valuing: Acceptance Preference Commitment
5. Synthesis: Communication Set of operations Abstract relations	Statistical techniques Future research Theoretical framework	Probability, randomness, X^2 , the unanswered questions of parapsychology and how they can be met. The theoretical explanation of psi (i.e., psi field).	Characterization
6. Evaluation: Internal evidence External criteria	Content analysis Statistical analysis	Similarity of case studies and application of statistics to the study of the evidence for psi.	

In order to clarify this chart, a more elaborate design can be presented. In the following survey, a four-way chart is drafted showing the relationship of a general learning model not only to general topics in parapsychology, but also to subject outlines and to a general *affective* taxonomy (learning as perceived by the student).

A general course outline on parapsychology, if properly employed, will meet both major objectives of learning; the gaining of knowledge and the evaluation of knowledge. These taxonomies are presented in answer to critics who argue that psi has little meaning or organization. While the *results* are sometimes sporadic or enigmatic, a structuring of parapsychology shows that by categorizing the principles and problems of the subject, a cohesive and meaningful organization can be made. From the educational standpoint, this also implies that parapsychology can easily be structured for classroom presentation and that this presentation can be successful.

REFERENCES

1. BLOOM, B. S. ET AL: *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives; the Classification of Educational Goals*, 2 handbooks (New York: David McKay, 1956-1964).

THE FUTURE OF EDUCATION IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY

Since education in parapsychology hardly has a past, it may be a bit ironical to talk of its future. Nonetheless, there are issues facing the development of education in this field that should be speculated upon in a book on education. In what direction is education in parapsychology going?

Since a general curriculum is only just being incorporated into the domains of the educational establishment, parapsychology courses are likely to be molded by trends prevalent in American education generally. In the previous section we discussed briefly the different approaches to parapsychology from the standpoint of subject-oriented and that of the student-oriented concepts. A generalized program of education in parapsychology could fit into either model, although the taxonomy of learning and education indicates that by adjusting and synthesizing both approaches, parapsychology can best be presented to the student. However, the issue is more complex; it applies not merely to the course outline of the curriculum, but also to the entire philosophy of education. Educational trends in parapsychology will no doubt be influenced by general educational trends and these, in turn, may show the way in which parapsychology will move as it finds a place in the American educational program.

Briefly, the debate centers around two trends in education, essentialism (based on realist and idealist schools of philosophical thought) and progressivism (based on experimentalism). Essentialism is based on the writings of William Bagley and has long been a dominant force in education.¹ Its core theory is that knowledge is a mixture of historical and contemporary elements and that the

fundamental goal of education is the learning and comprehension of subject matter; that learning by experience and observation can only be achieved by mastery of organized knowledge in any general field. Methodology is considered a natural outgrowth of discipline in the history, literature and memory-command of a subject. In every case, essentialism (which is the father of subject-oriented curriculum) stresses subject-matter.

Progressivism, stemming from the writings of John Dewey,² bases learning on the experience that knowledge is imparted as a product of social experience and experimentation; that knowledge must be functional, not academic. Problems cannot be defined, but must be discovered anew by the students.

One can see that these basic arguments about education in general will have a great bearing on education in parapsychology. Like the problem itself, parapsychology courses have shifted. Courses in the past have stressed a subject-centered approach, while many current courses stress the experimentalist aspects of the field.

Most of this discussion has been presented in the previous section and it is not odd that parapsychologists themselves are divided between those who favor experimental approaches and those who follow qualitative and scholarly approaches (though the two, of course, overlap). Whether parapsychology will eventually turn out more scholars or more experimentalists because of the educational resources available remains to be seen. Already the dominant trend can be seen from the number of student fellowships available listed at the end of Section III. Clearly an experience-oriented educational background is offered. Will the shift be from parapsychology as an academic discipline to one of an experimental science?

A basic scholarly approach based on essentialism would be as follows: learner as mechanism—teacher as demonstrator—subject matter of facts and ideals—goal of mastering these facts. Few courses seem to follow these ideals, and a dominant trend in education in psychical research is, as is to be expected, falling in line with the new progressivist movement: learner as experiencing organ—teacher as director—subject matter of experience—goal of problem solving.

We are right back to the discussion of subject vs. student emphasis, although in this case the issue has expanded from considerations of curricula to the entire future of an educational program in parapsychology.

Progressivism is a growing trend in American education and parapsychology will probably be absorbed into this movement for better or for worse.

If parapsychology does receive the status of a university discipline, what is its outlook for growth? Why has parapsychology finally been accepted by part of the scientific community? The reason is that parapsychology proved not only that it can adopt the methods and ideals of both behavioral and physical science in its studies, but that the scientific establishment is also beginning to give some sort of credence to the evidence for psi. In the second section, two psychology textbooks were cited as including pertinent information on parapsychology. If parapsychology does get full acceptance, will the investigations of psychical phenomena be absorbed into other sciences? Will not the study of ESP be incorporated under the general heading of perception as studied by mainline psychology? Similarly, will not PK be absorbed into the realm of physics? Already parapsychologists themselves are being faced with the need to revise the subject matter of psychical research. Recently, Rosalind Heywood, a vice-president of the SPR, suggested that PK is really a study for physicists, not parapsychologists. We must face the fact that in a hundred years or so a general framework of the study of parapsychology may be completely different from what we know it as today. Parapsychology appears to be the study of the unknown; once the mechanism of a phenomenon is understood, it is no longer studied. This general theory is borne out from the history of parapsychology. In the early years of organized research, hypnosis was an integral part of psychic studies; it is now within the jurisdiction of psychology. Multiple personality cases, which were originally reported in psychical journals, are no longer part of our study. Even such a phenomenon as dowsing has left the domain of parapsychology and entered that of the more traditional sciences. One is forced into the ironic situation that parapsychology, as we know it, may well be in the same position as alchemy was to chemistry in the Middle Ages.

This changing emphasis may well have a crucial bearing on the evolution of education in this field. For, as more and more psi effects are being studied by other more established scientific disciplines, the more they are likely to be absorbed in broad education within such disciplines. And just as parapsychology finds new topics to investigate, so will these topics be in disfavor with academic sci-

ence and the situation of parapsychology as an academic discipline and university study will once again become precarious.*

Actually, from my own point of view, only the survival issue is the one stable subject of perennial psychical concern; it is the one fundamental issue of parapsychology which has not changed its position in the study of psychical phenomena over the years. Since I doubt there will ever be any general agreement on the survival problem, I can safely say that the study of the possible interplay of post-mortem intelligence in various types of psi phenomena will be an enduring one, whatever direction parapsychology may take in the future. This basic subject, a crucial one to many of us who are involved in the field, is no doubt the one realm of inquiry the scientific establishment looks upon with the greatest disfavor, and I expect it to remain a deterrent force in the total acceptance of parapsychology. However, again from a personal viewpoint, this is an inevitable problem based on the inherent structure of psychical phenomena. The problem does not lie with parapsychology, but with science in general, which seems uneasy about applying scientific methods of study to what it may feel is a metaphysical issue (survival of death). Perhaps parapsychology's preoccupation with gaining scientific acceptance has been a key reason for the trend away from survival research in contemporary parapsychology.†

Because of these factors, and the shifting subject matter, it is a moot point whether parapsychology can ever find a permanent place in university curricula.

If the trend is toward experimentalism, this, too, might ultimately tell against an established parapsychology curriculum. If the academic study of psychical phenomena becomes merely a matter of historical interest or novelty, augmenting the experimentalist approach (and many courses treat it as such), training in parapsychology may well become a part of experimental psychology.

On the other hand, a different sort of assimilation might develop. It already appears that certain variables are common to ESP and PK, and perhaps parapsychology may remain a discipline of its

* For example, UFOs are not in the domain of psychical research. However, C. Maxwell Cade has suggested parallels between UFOs and apparitions. In the October, 1971 issue of the *Journal of the ASPR* is a letter by Leslie Price which well argues the instability of parapsychological subject matter.

† I do feel, however, that survival research is making a comeback. Perhaps, according to my own theory, because other issues are *en route* to being resolved?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

own because of possible future discoveries of an all-encompassing basic operative structure. In this case, education in parapsychology may develop into several units of study. For example, take a general course sequence in music, which has three main areas of discipline: history and literature; theory; and performance. So could the development of educational programs in parapsychology blossom into a number of areas of individualized study: history and literature of parapsychology; theory of psi; experimentation. Already a few courses are offered for advanced discussion growing out of larger and more general survey courses. Unfortunately parapsychology is still an interdisciplinary study that has borrowed explanatory models from physical science, and methodology from experimental psychology. Its terminology and variables have been taken from psychology, and it may be difficult for parapsychology to break away from these disciplines to become an independent study.

These few ideas only illustrate how new trends in education may conceivably affect models for education in parapsychology. Education in this field is a critical need if parapsychology, in any form, is to survive beyond the domain of a scientific curiosity. The main concern is for an immediate program in education—informal education of the public, a broad educational background for university students, and a specialized training background in both history and literature of psychical research as well as experimental experience for those who wish to embark upon a life study in parapsychology. Let all of us, parapsychologist or observer of parapsychology, ponder: How did we get our background in psychical research? No doubt by digging out the material ourselves with no guidance; reading books; discriminating between fact and fable; studying journals; with little encouragement and perhaps in the face of antagonism from home, school or church—finally slowly building this self-taught disorganized knowledge into an organized scheme of facts, theories and opinions. Let us hope that the next generation will not be faced with this same ordeal.

REFERENCES

1. BAGLEY, WILLIAM C.: "An Essentialist's Platform for the Advancement of American Education," *Educational Administration and Supervision*, April 1938.
2. DEWEY, JOHN: *Experience and Education* (New York: Macmillan, 1938).

- Bagley, William C.: "An Essentialist's Platform for the Advancement of American Education," *Educational Administration and Supervision*, April 1938.
- Bayless, Raymond: *Apparitions and Survival of Death*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1973.
- : *Enigma of the Poltergeist*, West Nyack, N.Y.: Parker Publishing Co., 1967; pap., New York: Ace Books, 1968.
- Besterman, Theodore: "Swedenborg as a Clairvoyant," in *Collected Papers on the Paranormal*. New York: Garrett Publications, 1968.
- Broad, C. D.: *Lectures on Psychical Research*. New York: Humanities Press, 1962.
- Brown, Slater: *The Heyday of Spiritualism*. New York: Hawthorn Books, 1970; Pocket Books, 1972.
- Bugelski, B. R.: *An Introduction to the Principles of Psychology*. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1960.
- Burt, Cyril: *Psychology and Psychical Research*: 17th Frederic W. H. Myers Memorial Lecture, 1968. London: Society for Psychical Research, 1968.
- Carrington, Hereward, and Fodor, Nandor: *Haunted People*. New York: E. P. Dutton, 1951; New American Library, Signet, 1968.
- : *Eusapia Palladino and her Phenomena*. New York: B. W. Dodge & Co., 1909.
- Carrington, Hereward, and Fodor, Nandor: *Haunted People*. New York: E. P. Dutton, 1951; New American Library, Signet, 1968.
- Ciba Foundation Symposium on Extrasensory Perception*. See Wolstenholme, G. E. W., and Millar, Elaine, C. P., editors.
- Cohen, Daniel: "Parapsychology in the Mass Media," in *A Century of Psychical Research*; proceedings of an international conference, September 1970. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1971.
- Crookall, Robert: *The Study and Practice of Astral Projection*. London: Aquarian Press, 1961; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1966.
- : *More Astral Projections*. London: Aquarian Press, 1964.
- Deese, James E.: *General Psychology*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1967.
- Dewey, John: *Experience and Education*. New York: Macmillan, 1938.
- Dingwall, Eric J.: *Abnormal Hypnotic Phenomena—A Survey of Nineteenth Century Cases*, 4 vols. London: J. & A. Churchill; New York: Barnes & Noble; 1967, 1968.
- Dodds, E. R.: "Supernormal Phenomena in Classical Antiquity," *Proc. Soc. Psych. Res.* 55 (1971): 189-237.
- Dommeier, Frederick, and White, Rhea: "Psychical Research in Colleges and Universities," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 57 (1963): 3-31, 55-105, 136-162; 58 (1964): 79-104.
- Dunne, J. W.: *An Experiment with Time*. London: Faber and Faber, 1927.
- Ebon, Martin: *Prophecy in Our Time*. New York: New American Library, 1968.
- Edmunds, Simeon: *Hypnotism and the Supernormal*. London: Aquarian Press; Hackensack, N.J.: Wehman Bros.; 1961.
- Eisenbud, Jule: *The World of Ted Serios*. New York: William Morrow, 1967; Paperback Library, 1969.
- Elliott, Richard M. (ed.): *The Century Psychology Series; Textbooks in psychology*. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts.
- Engle, T. L., and Snellgrove, L.: *Psychology—Its Principles and Applications*, 4th ed. New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1964.
- Fielding, Everard: *Sittings with Eusapia Palladino and Other Studies*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1963.

- Fodor, Nandor: *Encyclopaedia of Psychic Science*. London: Arthurs Press, 1933; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1966.
- Forwald, Haakon: "A Further Study of the PK Placement Effect," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 59-67; "A Continuation of the Experiments in Placement PK," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 273-283; "Chronological Decline Effects in a PK Placement Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 32-36; "An Approach to Instrumental Investigation of Psychokinesis," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 219-233; "Experiments with Alternating PK Placement and Control Tests," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 45-51; "A Study of Psychokinesis in its Relation to Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 133-154; "A Continuation of the Study of Psychokinesis and Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 21 (1957): 98-121; "An Experimental Study Suggesting a Relationship between Psychokinesis and Nuclear Conditions of Matter," *J. Parapsychol.* 23 (1959): 97-125; "A PK Experiment with Die Faces as Targets," *J. Parapsychol.* 25 (1961): 1-12; "An Experiment in Guessing ESP Cards by Throwing a Die," *J. Parapsychol.* 27 (1963): 16-22.
- : *Mind, Matter, and Gravitation*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 11. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1969.
- Gauld, Alan: *The Founders of Psychical Research*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1968.
- Gurney, Edmund; Myers, Frederic W. H.; and Podmore, Frank: *Phantasms of the Living*, 2 vols. London: Society for Psychical Research, Trübner & Co., 1886; Abridged ed. by Mrs. Henry Sidgwick, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1962.
- Hansel, C. E. M.: *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966.
- Hardinge [Britten], Emma: *Modern American Spiritualism*. New York, 1970; reprint, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1970.
- Hart, Hornell et al.: "Six Theories about Apparitions," *Proc. Soc. Psych. Res.* 50 (1956): 153-239.
- Heywood, Rosalind: "Attitudes to Death in the Light of Dreams and Other Out-of-the-Body Experiences," in *Man's Concern with Death*, edited by Arnold Toynbee and others. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1968; New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969.
- : *Beyond the Reach of Sense; an Inquiry into Extrasensory Perception*. New York: Dutton, 1961. British ed., *The Sixth Sense*, London: Chatto & Windus, 1959.
- Hilgard, E. R., and Atkinson, R. C.: *Introduction to Psychology*, 5th ed. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971.
- Holms, A. Campbell: *Facts of Psychic Science*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 1925; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1969.
- Horton, Charles, and Krippner, Stanley: "Hypnosis and ESP Performance—A Review of the Experimental Literature," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 63 (1969): 214-252.
- Jensen, Ann, and Watkins, Mary Lou: *Franz Anton Mesmer—Physician Extraordinaire*. New York: Garrett Publications, 1967.
- Johnson, Raynor: *The Imprisoned Splendour*. New York: Harper & Row, 1953; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1971.
- : *Psychical Research*. London: English Universities Press, 1955; New York: Funk and Wagnalls, pap., 1968.
- ✓ *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* 61 (1967): 95-119; 62 (1968): 28-45, 158-170, 171-189, 226-244; 63 (1969): 21-37, 253-272; 64 (1970): 18-39; 65 (1971): 75-82.
- ✓ *Journal of Paraphysics*, Vol. 2, Nos. 3, 5; Vol. 3, Nos. 3, 4; Vol. 4, Nos. 1, 2, 3; Vol. 5, No. 5. Downton, Wiltshire, England: Paraphysical Laboratory.
- ✓ *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research* 42 (1964): 381-389.
- ✓ Karlins, Marvin (ed.): *Psychology and Society*. New York: Wiley, 1971.
- Lindgren, H. C.; Byrne, E. D.; and Petrinovich, L.: *Psychology: An Introduction to a Behavioral Science*, 2nd ed. New York: Wiley, 1966.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A.: *ESP Curriculum Guide*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1971.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A., and Forwald, Haakon: "Psychokinetic Placement: I. A Re-Examination of the Forwald-Durham Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 51-69; "Psychokinetic Placement: II. A Factorial Study of Successful and Unsuccessful Series," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 198-213; "Psychokinetic Placement: III. Cube-Releasing Devices," *J. Parapsychol.* 32 (1968): 9-38.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A., and McConnell, T.: "Occult Books at the University of Pittsburgh," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 344-353.
- MacDonald, John: *A Philosophy of Education*. Scarborough, Canada: W. J. Gage, 1965.
- McDougall, William: "Psychical Research as a University Study," in *The Case For and Against Psychical Belief*, edited by Carl Murchison. Worcester, Mass.: Clark University Press, 1927.
- McKeachie, W. J., and Doyle, C. L.: *Psychology*. Reading, Mass. and Palo Alto, Calif.: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., 1966.
- McMahon, Frank: *Psychology, the Hybrid Science*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1972.
- Madigan, Marian: *Psychology, Principles and Applications*, 4th ed. St. Louis, Mo.: C. W. Mosby Co., 1966.
- Mangan, Gordon: *A Review of Published Research on the Relationship of Some Personality Variables to ESP Scoring Level*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 1. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1958.
- Medhurst, R. G., ed.: *Crookes and the Spirit World*. London: Souvenir Press; New York: Taplinger, 1972.
- : "The Fraudulent Experimenter: Professor Hansel's Case Against Psychical Research," *J. Soc. Psych. Res.* 44 (1968): 217-231.
- Muldoon, Sylvan, and Carrington, Hereward: *The Phenomena of Astral Projection*. London: Rider & Co., 1951; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969.
- : *The Projection of the Astral Body*. London: Rider & Co., 1929, 1956; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, n.d.
- Murphy, Gardner: *Challenge of Psychical Research*. New York: Harper & Row, 1961.
- Nelson, Geoffrey K.: *Spiritualism and Society*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1969.
- Omez, Réginald: "Psychical Phenomena." Trans. from the French by Renée Haynes. Vol. 36 of the *Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Catholicism*. New York: Hawthorn Books, 1958.
- Osborn, Arthur W.: *The Future Is Now*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1961; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1967.
- Osis, Karlis, and Turner, Malcolm E.: "Distance and ESP—A Transcontinental Experiment," *Proc. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 27 (1968): 1-48.
- Owen, A. R. G.: *Can We Explain the Poltergeist?* New York: Garrett Publications, 1964.
- Palmer, John: "Scoring in ESP Tests as a Function of Belief in ESP," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 73-408; 66 (1972): 1-27.
- Prätt, J. G.: "William McDougall and Present-Day Psychical Research," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 64 (1970): 385-403.
- Price, George: "Science and the Supernatural," *Science*, August 26, 1955.

- Fodor, Nandor: *Encyclopaedia of Psychic Science*. London: Arthurs Press, 1933; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1966.
- Forwald, Haakon: "A Further Study of the PK Placement Effect," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 59-67; "A Continuation of the Experiments in Placement PK," *J. Parapsychol.* 16 (1952): 273-283; "Chronological Decline Effects in a PK Placement Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 32-36; "An Approach to Instrumental Investigation of Psychokinesis," *J. Parapsychol.* 18 (1954): 219-233; "Experiments with Alternating PK Placement and Control Tests," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 45-51; "A Study of Psychokinesis in its Relation to Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 19 (1955): 133-154; "A Continuation of the Study of Psychokinesis and Physical Conditions," *J. Parapsychol.* 21 (1957): 98-121; "An Experimental Study Suggesting a Relationship between Psychokinesis and Nuclear Conditions of Matter," *J. Parapsychol.* 23 (1959): 97-125; "A PK Experiment with Die Faces as Targets," *J. Parapsychol.* 25 (1961): 1-12; "An Experiment in Guessing ESP Cards by Throwing a Die," *J. Parapsychol.* 27 (1963): 16-22.
- : *Mind, Matter, and Gravitation*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 11. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1969.
- Gauld, Alan: *The Founders of Psychical Research*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1968.
- Gurney, Edmund; Myers, Frederic W. H.; and Podmore, Frank: *Phantasms of the Living*, 2 vols. London: Society for Psychical Research, Trübner & Co., 1886; Abridged ed. by Mrs. Henry Sidgwick, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1962.
- Hansel, C. E. M.: *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966.
- Hardinge [Britten], Emma: *Modern American Spiritualism*. New York, 1970; reprint, New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1970.
- Hart, Hornell et al.: "Six Theories about Apparitions," *Proc. Soc. Psych. Res.* 50 (1956): 153-239.
- Heywood, Rosalind: "Attitudes to Death in the Light of Dreams and Other Out-of-the-Body Experiences," in *Man's Concern with Death*, edited by Arnold Toynbee and others. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1968; New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969.
- : *Beyond the Reach of Sense; an Inquiry into Extrasensory Perception*. New York: Dutton, 1961. British ed., *The Sixth Sense*, London: Chatto & Windus, 1959.
- Hilgard, E. R., and Atkinson, R. C.: *Introduction to Psychology*, 5th ed. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971.
- Holms, A. Campbell: *Facts of Psychic Science*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 1925; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1969.
- Honorton, Charles, and Krippner, Stanley: "Hypnosis and ESP Performance—A Review of the Experimental Literature," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 63 (1969): 214-252.
- Jensen, Ann, and Watkins, Mary Lou: *Franz Anton Mesmer—Physician Extraordinaire*. New York: Garrett Publications, 1967.
- Johnson, Raynor: *The Imprisoned Splendour*. New York: Harper & Row, 1953; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1971.
- : *Psychical Research*. London: English Universities Press, 1955; New York: Funk and Wagnalls, pap., 1968.
- ✓ *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* 61 (1967): 95-119; 62 (1968): 28-45, 158-170, 171-189, 226-244; 63 (1969): 21-37, 253-272; 64 (1970): 18-39; 65 (1971): 75-82.
- ✓ *Journal of Paraphysics*, Vol. 2, Nos. 3, 5; Vol. 3, Nos. 3, 4; Vol. 4, Nos. 1, 2, 3; Vol. 5, No. 5. Downton, Wiltshire, England: Paraphysical Laboratory.
- ✓ *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research* 42 (1964): 381-389.
- ✓ Karlins, Marvin (ed.): *Psychology and Society*. New York: Wiley, 1971.
- ✓ Lindgren, H. C.; Byrne, E. D.; and Petrinovich, L.: *Psychology: An Introduction to a Behavioral Science*, 2nd ed. New York: Wiley, 1966.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A.: *ESP Curriculum Guide*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1971.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A., and Forwald, Haakon: "Psychokinetic Placement: I. A Re-Examination of the Forwald-Durham Experiment," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 51-69; "Psychokinetic Placement: II. A Factorial Study of Successful and Unsuccessful Series," *J. Parapsychol.* 31 (1967): 198-213; "Psychokinetic Placement: III. Cube-Releasing Devices," *J. Parapsychol.* 32 (1968): 9-38.
- ✓ McConnell, R. A., and McConnell, T.: "Occult Books at the University of Pittsburgh," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 344-353.
- MacDonald, John: *A Philosophy of Education*. Scarborough, Canada: W. J. Gage, 1965.
- McDougall, William: "Psychical Research as a University Study," in *The Case For and Against Psychical Belief*, edited by Carl Murchison. Worcester, Mass.: Clark University Press, 1927.
- McKeachie, W. J., and Doyle, C. L.: *Psychology*. Reading, Mass. and Palo Alto, Calif.: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., 1966.
- McMahon, Frank: *Psychology, the Hybrid Science*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1972.
- Madigan, Marian: *Psychology, Principles and Applications*, 4th ed. St. Louis, Mo.: C. W. Mosby Co., 1966.
- Mangan, Gordon: *A Review of Published Research on the Relationship of Some Personality Variables to ESP Scoring Level*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 1. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1958.
- Medhurst, R. G., ed.: *Crookes and the Spirit World*. London: Souvenir Press; New York: Taplinger, 1972.
- : "The Fraudulent Experimenter: Professor Hansel's Case Against Psychical Research," *J. Soc. Psych. Res.* 44 (1968): 217-231.
- Muldoon, Sylvan, and Carrington, Hereward: *The Phenomena of Astral Projection*. London: Rider & Co., 1951; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969.
- : *The Projection of the Astral Body*. London: Rider & Co., 1929, 1956; pap., New York: Samuel Weiser, n.d.
- Murphy, Gardner: *Challenge of Psychical Research*. New York: Harper & Row, 1961.
- Nelson, Geoffrey K.: *Spiritualism and Society*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul; New York: Schocken Books; 1969.
- Omez, Réginald: "Psychical Phenomena." Trans. from the French by Renée Haynes. Vol. 36 of the *Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Catholicism*. New York: Hawthorn Books, 1958.
- Osborn, Arthur W.: *The Future Is Now*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1961; Wheaton, Ill.: Theosophical Publishing House, Quest Book, 1967.
- Osis, Karlis, and Turner, Malcolm E.: "Distance and ESP—A Transcontinental Experiment," *Proc. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 27 (1968): 1-48.
- Owen, A. R. G.: *Can We Explain the Poltergeist?* New York: Garrett Publications, 1964.
- Palmer, John: "Scoring in ESP Tests as a Function of Belief in ESP," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 65 (1971): 73-408; 66 (1972): 1-27.
- Prätt, J. G.: "William McDougall and Present-Day Psychical Research," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 64 (1970): 385-403.
- Price, George: "Science and the Supernatural," *Science*, August 26, 1955.

- Rao, K. Ramakrishna: *Experimental Parapsychology*. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1966.
- Reichenbach, Karl von: *The Odic Force; Letters on Od and Magnetism*. Trans. and introd. by F. D. O'Byrne. London: Hutchinson & Co., 1926; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1968.
- Rhine, J. B.: *Extra-Sensory Perception*. Boston: Boston Society for Psychic Research, 1934; Bruce Humphries, 1964.
- : *New Frontiers of the Mind*. London: Faber and Faber, 1937; New York: Farrar and Rhinehart, 1937.
- : *The Reach of the Mind*. New York: William Sloane, 1947; Apollo, 1961; William Morrow, 1971.
- Rhine, J. B., and Pratt, J. G.: *Parapsychology—Frontier Science of the Mind*. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1957; rev. ed., 1962.
- Rhine, J. B. and others: *Extra-Sensory Perception after Sixty Years*. New York: Henry Holt, 1940; Boston: Bruce Humphries, 1966.
- Rhine, Louisa E.: *ESP in Life and Lab*. New York: Macmillan, 1967.
- : *Manual for Introductory Experiments in Parapsychology*. Durham, N.C.: Parapsychology Press, 1966.
- : *Mind over Matter*. New York: Macmillan, 1970.
- Rogo, D. Scott: "The Faunus Message": A Review and New Interpretation," *J. Soc. Psych. Res.* 46 (1971): 223-227.
- : *The Welcoming Silence*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1973.
- Roll, W. G.: "Pagenstecher's Contribution to Parapsychology," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 61 (1967): 219-240.
- Ruch, Floyd: *Psychology and Life*, 7th ed. Glenview, Ill.: Scott, Foresman & Co., 1967.
- Ryzl, Milan: *Parapsychology—A Scientific Approach*. New York: Hawthorn Books, 1970.
- Salter, W. H.: *Trance Mediumship: An Introductory Study of Mrs. Piper and Mrs. Leonard*. London: Society for Psychical Research, 1950; rev. ed. by Margaret Eastman, 1962.
- : *Zoar; or the Evidence of Psychical Research Concerning Survival*. London: Sidgwick & Jackson, 1961.
- Saltmarsh, H. F.: *Evidence of Personal Survival from Cross-Correspondences*. London: Bell & Sons, 1938.
- Schmeidler, Gertrude: *ESP in Relation to Rorschach Test Evaluation*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 2. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1960.
- Schmeidler, Gertrude R., and McConnell, R. A.: *ESP and Personality Patterns*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1958.
- Sells, S. B.: *Essentials of Psychology*. New York: Ronald Press, 1962.
- Shirley, Ralph: *The Mystery of the Human Double*. London: Rider & Co., n.d.; New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1965.
- : *Occultists and Mystics of All Ages*. London: Rider, 1920; New Hyde Park: University Books, 1972.
- Sinclair, Upton: *Mental Radio*. Pasadena, Calif.: author, 1930; rev. 2nd printing, Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1962; pap., New York: Macmillan, 1971.
- Smith, Susy: *The Enigma of Out-of-Body Travel*. New York: Garrett Publications, 1965; pap., New American Library, n.d.
- : *The Mediumship of Mrs. Leonard*. New Hyde Park, N.Y.: University Books, 1964.
- Smythies, J. R. (ed.): *Science and ESP*. New York: Humanities Press, 1967.

- Soal, S. G., and Bateman, F.: *Modern Experiments in Telepathy*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1954.
- Somerlott, Robert: "Here, Mr. Splitfoot." New York: Viking Press, 1971.
- Stevenson, Ian: "An Antagonist's View of Parapsychology. A review of Professor Hansel's book, *ESP—A Scientific Evaluation*," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 61 (1967): 254-267.
- Sudre, René: *Parapsychology*, trans. by C. E. Green. New York: Citadel Press, 1960; orig. ed., Paris: Payot, 1956.
- Swartz, Paul: *Psychology, the Study of Behavior*. New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Co., 1963.
- Tanagras, A.: *Psychophysical Elements in Parapsychological Traditions*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 7. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1967.
- Tart, Charles T.: "A Psychophysiological Study of Out-of-the-Body Experiences in a Selected Subject," *J. Amer. Soc. Psych. Res.* 62 (1968): 3-27.
- : "A Second Psychophysiological Study of Out-of-the-Body Experiences in a Gifted Subject," *Int. J. Parapsychol.* 9 (1967): 251-258.
- Thouless, R. H.: *From Anecdote to Experiment in Psychical Research*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972.
- Tietze, Thomas R.: "Eusapia Palladino—A Study in Paradox," *Psychic*, January-February, March-April, 1972.
- Toksvig, Signe: *Emanuel Swedenborg, Scientist and Mystic*. London: Faber and Faber, 1948.
- Tyrrell, G. N. M.: *Apparitions*. London: Gerald Duckworth, 1953; New York: Collier-Macmillan, 1962, 1970.
- Ullman, Montague, and Krippner, Stanley: *Dream Studies and Telepathy*. Parapsychological Monograph No. 12. New York: Parapsychology Foundation, 1970.
- Waite, A. E.: *Alchemists Through the Ages*. Orig. ed., London: 1888; New York: Rudolf Steiner Publications, 1970.
- Warcollier, René: *Mind to Mind*. New York: Creative Age Press, 1948; Collier-Macmillan, 1963.
- West, D. J.: *Tests for Extrasensory Perception*, rev. ed., London: Society for Psychical Research, 1954.
- Wolstenholme, G. E. W., and Millar, Elaine C. P. (eds.): *Ciba Foundation Symposium on Extrasensory Perception*. Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1956.

INDEX

adult education classes, 2, 53
 alchemy, 60
 Allegheny Community College, 28
 American Institute of Mathematical
 Statistics, 20
 Andhra University, 50
 apparitions, 2, 3, 33, 38, 61n
 astrology, 12, 14
 Atkinson, R. C., 4, 8, 13, 20, 26, 64

Bagley, William, 58, 62, 63
 Bateman, F., 13, 46, 66
 Bayless, Raymond, 33, 47, 63
 Besterman, Theodore, 14, 30, 45, 63
 Birge, W. R., 40
 Bloom, B. S., 54, 57
 Brier, Robert, 2, 27
 Broad, C. D., 14, 32, 33, 35, 36, 41,
 46, 47, 48, 63
 Brooklyn College, 2, 53
 Brown, Slater, 30, 45, 46, 63
 Browning, Norma, 13
 Brugmans, H., 32
 Bugelski, B. R., 21
 Burt, Cyril, 38, 48, 63
 Burt, F. P., 32
 Byrne, D., 20, 46, 65

C., Eva, 37
 C. W. Post College, 2, 28
 Cade, C. Maxwell, 61n
 California Parapsychology Foundation,
 28
 Calvin College, 28
 Carington Whateley, 32, 35, 36, 42,
 63
 Carrington, Hereward, 14, 20, 26, 33,
 37, 38, 47, 48, 65
 Casler, Lawrence, 2
 Churches' Fellowship for Psychical
 and Spiritual Studies, 11
 Ciba Foundation, 21, 26, 63, 67
 clairvoyance (see also ESP), 36, 44
 Cohen, Daniel, 16, 18, 26, 63
 College of the City of New York, 2,
 10, 50
 Cook, Florence, 31
 Coover, J. E., 21, 32
 Cox, William, 37, 40, 43
 Crawford, W. J., 37
 Crookall, Robert, 38, 48, 63

Crookes, William, 31
 cross-correspondences, 3, 31-2
 curricula, general, 2, 4; models for,
 27-51; problems of, v, 1, 2-3, 3-4,
 5, 33-5, 38-40, 43-4, 51, 58-60;
 student centered, 51-3, 59; subject
 centered, 51-3, 59

Davis, A. J., 30
 Deese, James, 21, 26, 63
 déjà-vu, 3
 Delphic Oracle, 30
 De Puységur, 30
 dermo-optical perception, 3
 Dewey, John, 59, 62, 63
 Dialectical Society, 31
 Dingwall, Eric J., 30, 45, 63
 Dodds, E. R., 30, 45, 63
 Dommeyer, Frederick, 10, 26, 35n,
 47, 63
 dowsing, 60
 Doyle, C. L., 21, 26, 65
 dreaming, 28, 35, 36
 Duke University (see also Rhine,
 J. B.), 27, 32, 33, 50
 Dunne, J. W., 36, 47, 63

Ebon, Martin, 36, 47, 63
 Edmunds, Simeon, 30, 45, 63
 education, American system of, v;
 approaches to, 51-7; church, 11-3;
 family, 11; future of, 58-62; goals
 of, 23-5; media, 11, 15-9; need for,
 v, 62; peer group, 11, 13-5; phil-
 osophy of, 23-5, 58-60; previous,
 11-23; problems of, v, 4, 5-7, 9-23;
 process of, v, 54-7; student cen-
 tered, 51-3, 59; subject centered,
 51-3, 59
 eidetic imagery, 3
 Eisenbud, Jule, 38, 48, 63
 Engle, T. E., 22, 26, 63
 ESP (see also clairvoyance, telepa-
 thy), 2, 3, 14, 15, 19, 20, 21, 22,
 32-3, 34, 35-6, 40-2, 43, 44, 57,
 60, 61; books on, 45-9, 62-7
 essentialism, 58-9
 extension courses, 2, 11, 28
 Fielding, Everard, 37, 48, 63
 Fodor, Nandor, 31, 33, 46, 47, 63

Forthuny, Pascal, 36
 Forwald, Haakon, 20, 37, 40, 43, 47,
 49, 64
 Freiburg University, 10, 50
 FRNM, 50

Garrett Publications, 18
 Gasparin, A. de, 31
 Gauld, Alan, 30, 31, 45, 46, 64
 Geley, Gustave, 32
 Goligher Circle, 37
 Grossmont College, 28
 Gurney, Edmund, 8, 38, 46, 63
 Guzik, Jean, 32

Hansel, C. E. M., 13, 20, 26, 29, 30,
 45, 64
 Hardinge, Emma, 30, 46, 64
 Hart, Hornell, 33, 38, 47, 64
 hauntings, 38
 Heywood, Rosalind, 31, 32, 46, 48,
 60, 64
 Hilgard, E. R., 5, 8, 13, 20, 26, 64
 Hodgson, Richard, 34n
 Holmes, Campbell, 37, 48, 64
 Home, D. D., 31
 Honorton, Charles, 2, 27, 42, 49, 52,
 64
 hyperesthesia, 3
 Hyslop, James, 34n
 hypnosis (see also Mesmerism), 28,
 30, 60

Institut Métapsychique, 32

James, William, 13, 14, 20
 Jastrow, Joseph, 20
 Jensen, Anne, 30, 45, 64
 Jephson, I., 32
 Johnson, Miss, 40
 Johnson, Raynor, 31, 32, 36, 46, 47,
 64

Karlins, Marvin, 6n, 8, 19, 26, 64
 Kluski, Franek, 32, 37
 Krippner, Stanley, 2, 36, 42, 47, 49,
 50, 64, 67
 Kulagina, Nina, 37

learning, affective, 56, 57; cognitive,
 54-7; process of, 24-5, 51-7;
 taxonomies of, 54-7
 Leonard, Gladys Osborne, 3, 31, 32,
 37
 Lindgren, H. C., 20, 26, 65

Lodge, Oliver, 34n
 London Psychological Society, 31
 Los Angeles Times, 17

MacDonald, John, 23, 26, 65
 McConnell, R. A., 4, 6n, 8, 14, 18,
 19, 21, 26, 28, 40, 42, 43, 45, 48,
 65, 66
 McConnell, T., 14, 26, 65
 McDougall, William, 7, 8, 9-10, 24-5,
 53, 65
 McKeachie, W., 21, 26, 65
 McMahan, F., 22, 26, 65
 Madigan, Marian, 20, 26, 65
 Maimonides Medical Center, 50
 Mangan, Gordon, 42, 49, 65
 Medhurst, R. G., 31, 45, 46, 65
 mediumship (also see individual
 names), 3, 31-2, 37-8, 40, 44
 Menninger Dream Laboratory, 50
 Mesmerism, 30
 Millar, Elaine C. P. (see Ciba Foun-
 dation), 67
 Moore, Henry, 50
 Morris, Robert, 27
 Muldoon, Sylvan, 38, 48, 65
 Murphy, Gardner, 3, 13, 16, 20, 35n,
 36, 47, 65
 Murray, Gilbert, 32, 33, 35
 Myers, F. W. H., 8, 14, 34n, 38, 46,
 64

Nash, Carroll, 2
 Nelson, G. K., 30, 45, 64
 Newark College of Engineering, 10
 New School for Social Research, 3
 newspapers, 17
 Newsweek, 17
 Notre Dame College of St. John's
 University, 27, 52

occultism, 3, 12, 30
 Omez, Reginald, 12, 26, 33, 46, 65
 Osborn, Arthur, 36, 47, 65
 Osis, Karlis, 42, 49, 65
 Ossowiecki, Stephan, 36
 Osty, Eugène, 36
 out-of-the-body experiences, 33, 38
 Owen, A. R. G., 33, 47, 65

P——, Stanislaw, 32
 Pagenstecher, Gustave, 36
 Palladino, Eusapia, 20, 32, 37
 Palmer, John, 42, 49, 65
 parapsychology (also see individual

topics in), as science, 1; books on, 13-4, 14-5, 45-50, 62-7; courses in, 25, 27-8; criticisms of, 9-10, 17, 19-22, 29-30, 61; educational opportunities; 50

Parapsychology Foundation, v

Pearce, Hubert, 40, 41

Piper, Leonore, 3, 31-2, 34n, 37

Petrinovich, L., 20, 26, 65

Podmore, Frank, 8, 32, 46, 64

poltergeists, 37, 44

Pratt, J. G., 10, 13, 20, 26, 40, 41, 43, 48, 49, 65, 66

precognition, 3, 36

Price, Alan, 2, 30

Price, George, 22, 29, 45, 65

Price, Leslie, 61n

Prince, W. F., 14

progressivism, 58, 59

psi (see ESP, PK)

psychokinesis (PK), 2, 3, 20, 21, 22, 37, 40, 41, 42, 42-3, 44, 56, 60, 61

psychology, attitudes of, 9, 19-22; general, 5-6; and psi, 38, 41-2, 42-3, 56

radio, 17

Rao, K. Ramakrishna, 13, 36, 42, 43, 47, 49, 65

Reichenbach, Karl von, 30, 45, 66

Rhine, J. B., 13, 16, 20, 26, 32, 33, 35, 37, 40, 41, 43, 46, 47, 48, 49, 66

Rhine, Louisa, 13, 37, 42, 43, 47, 49, 66

Richet, Charles, 32

Rogers, David, 28

Rogo, D. Scott, 39, 46, 47, 66

Roll, W. G., 2, 33, 47, 50, 66

Ruch, Floyd, 22, 26, 66

Ryzl, Milan, 2, 28, 36, 47, 66

Salter, W. H., 31, 46, 66

Saltmarsh, H. F., 31, 36, 46, 66

San Diego State College, 2

Schmeidler, Gertrude, 2, 21, 28, 42, 49, 50, 66

Schneider, Rudi, 32, 37

Schneider, Willi, 32, 37

Schrenck-Notzing, Baron A. von, 32, 32n

science, goals and methods of, 1, 4; and psi, 38

Sells, S. B., 21, 26, 66

sensory deprivation, 28

Serios, Ted, 37, 38

Shackleton, Basil, 40

sheep-goat effect, 41, 56

Shirley, Ralph, 30, 38, 45, 48, 66

Sidgwick, Eleanor, 31, 46

Sinclair, Upton, 14, 32, 33, 46, 66

Smith, Susy, 32, 38, 46, 48, 66

Smythies, John, 38, 48, 66

Soal, S. G., 13, 20, 32, 33, 35, 36, 40, 41, 46, 66

Society for Psychical Research (SPR), 29, 30, 31, 44

Somerlott, Robert, 32, 46, 66

Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship, 11

Spiritualism, 12, 30

Stepanek, Pavel, 41

St. Joseph's College, 2, 10, 11

Stevenson, Ian, 45, 50, 67

Stewart, Gloria, 20, 40, 41

Stewart, Horace, 50

Stone, Clement, 13

Sudre, René, 14, 32, 36, 37, 46, 47, 48, 67

survival of death, 2, 14, 37, 61

Swartz, Paul, 22, 26, 67

Swedenborg, Emmanuel, 30

Tanagras, A., 36, 47, 67

Tart, Charles, 2, 38, 48, 50, 67

telekinesis (see psychokinesis)

telepathy (see also ESP), 3, 35-6, 44

television, 16

texts, problems of, v, 5-6; in parapsychology (see parapsychology, books on)

Thouless, Robert, 20, 35, 43, 49, 67

Thury, Marc, 31

Tietze, Thomas, 37, 48, 67

Time, 17

Toksvig, Signe, 30, 45, 67

Tomczyk, Stanisława, 32

Toynbee, Arnold, 38

Troland, L. T., 32

Turner, Malcolm, 49, 65

Tuttle, Hudson, 30

Tyrrell, G. N. M., 14, 33, 38, 40, 47, 67

UFOs, 14, 15, 61n

Ullman, Montague, 36, 47, 67

Usher, F. L., 32

University Books, 18

University of California, Davis, 2, 50

University of California, L.A., 11, 14, 16

University of California, San Diego, 28

University of Edinburgh, 50

University of North Carolina, 28

University of Pittsburgh, 10

University of Virginia, 10, 11, 50

University of Waterloo, 28

Utrecht University, 10

Verrall, Mrs., 3

Waite, A. E., 30, 45, 67

Walker, Kenneth, 13

Warcollier, René, 32, 33, 35, 46, 64

Watkins, Mary Lou, 30, 45

Wesleyan University, 2

West, D. J., 43, 49, 67

West Georgia College, 50

White, Rhea, 10, 26, 35n, 47, 63

Willett, Mrs., 3

witchcraft, 12, 14, 30

Wolstenholme, G. E. W. (see also Ciba Foundation), 67

Woodruff, J. L., 41

Z., Mme. Reyes de, 36

PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL MONOGRAPHS

- No. 1. A Review of Published Research on the Relationship of Some Personality Variables to ESP Scoring Level, by Gordon L. Mangan. 62 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 2. ESP in Relation to Rorschach Test Evaluation, by Gertrude Schmeidler. 89 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 3. Deathbed Observations by Physicians and Nurses, by Karlis Osis. 113 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 4. New Directions in Parapsychological Research, by Joseph H. Rush. 61 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 5. ESP Experiments with LSD 25 and Psilocybin, by Roberto Cavanna and Emilio Servadio. 123 pages. \$2.50.
- No. 6. Toward a New Philosophical Basis for Parapsychological Phenomena, by Hornell Hart. 68 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 7. Psychophysical Elements in Parapsychological Traditions, by A. Tanagras. 151 pages. \$3.00.
- No. 8. Paranormal Phenomena, Science, and Life After Death, by C. J. Ducasse. 63 pages. \$1.75.
- No. 9. Toward a General Theory of the Paranormal, by Lawrence LeShan. 112 pages. \$3.00.
- No. 10. On the Evaluation of Verbal Material in Parapsychology, by J. G. Pratt. 78 pages. \$2.00.
- No. 11. Mind, Matter, and Gravitation, by Haakon Forwald. 72 pages. \$3.00.
- No. 12. Dream Studies and Telepathy, by Montague Ullman and Stanley Krippner. 119 pages. \$3.00.
- No. 13. Experimental Studies of the Differential Effect in Life Setting, by P. Sailaja and K. R. Rao. 78 pages. \$3.00.

PARAPSYCHOLOGY REVIEW

Published six times a year. Subscription: \$4 for one year;
\$7 for two years; single copies 85¢.

PROCEEDINGS OF CONFERENCES OF THE
PARAPSYCHOLOGY FOUNDATION, INC.

**FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE
OF PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL STUDIES**

Abstracts of papers presented at the First International Conference of Parapsychological Studies, University of Utrecht, the Netherlands (July 30 to August 5, 1953). Opening Address by Gardner Murphy, Director of Research, Menninger Foundation. \$3.00

**FOUR INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCES
OF PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL STUDIES**

Abstracts of papers presented at the International Philosophic Symposium, St. Paul de Vence, France (April 20 to 26, 1954), the International Study Group on Unorthodox Healing, St. Paul de Vence (April 27 to May 1, 1954), the Conference on Spontaneous Phenomena, Cambridge, England (July 11 to 17, 1955) and the Symposium on "Psychology and Parapsychology," Royaumont, France (April 30 to May 4, 1956). \$3.00

**TWO CONFERENCES
ON PARAPSYCHOLOGY AND PHARMACOLOGY**

Abstracts of papers presented at the Conference on Parapsychology and Psychedelics, New York (November 15 and 16, 1958) and at the Conference on Parapsychology and Pharmacology, St. Paul de Vence, France (July 6 to 10, 1959). \$3.00

PSI AND ALTERED STATES OF CONSCIOUSNESS

Proceedings of an International Conference on Hypnosis, Drugs, Dreams, and Psi, held at St. Paul de Vence, France (June 9 to 12, 1967). Edited by Roberto Cavanna, Ph.D., and Montague Ullman, M.D. \$6.00

PSI FAVORABLE STATES OF CONSCIOUSNESS

Proceedings of an International Conference on Methodology in Psi Research, held at St. Paul de Vence, France (September 2 to 6, 1968). Edited by Roberto Cavanna, Ph.D. \$6.50

PSI FACTORS IN CREATIVITY

Proceedings of an International Conference on Psi Factors in Creativity held at St. Paul de Vence, France (June 16 to 18, 1969). Edited by Allan Angoff and Betty Shapin. \$6.00

**A CENTURY OF PSYCHICAL RESEARCH:
THE CONTINUING DOUBTS AND AFFIRMATIONS**

Proceedings of an International Conference held at St. Paul de Vence, France (September 2 to 4, 1970). Edited by Allan Angoff and Betty Shapin. \$6.00

PARAPSYCHOLOGY TODAY: A GEOGRAPHIC VIEW

Proceedings of an International Conference held at St. Paul de Vence, France (August 25 to 27, 1971). Edited by Allan Angoff and Betty Shapin. \$6.50

PARAPSYCHOLOGY FOUNDATION, INC.
29 West 57th St. New York, N. Y. 10019